IACA INTERNATIONAL ANTI-CORRUPTION ACADEMY

MASTER IN ANTI-CORRUPTION STUDIES PROGRAMME

UNDER THE UMBRELLA:

Youth and anti-corruption in Hong Kong

Lannie Su

2019

Supervisor: Professor Andrew Spalding

This publication is an adaptation of the master's thesis submitted to fulfil the requirements for the Master in Anti-Corruption Studies degree at the International Anti-Corruption Academy

I pledge on my honour that I have not plagiarized, used unauthorized materials, given and/or received illegitimate help on this assignment, and hold myself accountable to the academic standards binding upon students of the MACS programme.

Signature: ___Lannie Su_____ Date: ____12 October 2019_____

Table of Contents

Abstract

There is no doubt that Hong Kong's anti-corruption regime has proved to be a successful endeavor since the inception of the ICAC in 1974. The Independent Commission Against Corruption was founded during Hong Kong's dark old days, where bribery and tea money were daily transactions. In just a few decades, the ICAC transformed the hearts and minds of Hong Kong citizens, where corruption was no longer needed to advance in one's daily life. The ICAC's famous three-pronged approach, of investigation, prevention, and education, has been emulated by other countries in their attempts to curb corruption. External factors, such as Hong Kong's rule of law, strong political will, and democratic freedom of the press, have been cited by previous researchers as important factors contributing to the ICAC's success. Through the years, the Community Relations Department within the ICAC set out to create a moral climate in Hong Kong intolerant of corruption.

Creation of an improved moral climate, along with the changing of the population's mindset, marked the beginning of an era at the ICAC. Once the general population developed an innate intolerance to corruption, sustaining this moral climate for future generations rested on the shoulders of the oft overlooked Youth and Moral Education Office. This research conducts a case study analysis of the youth education campaigns produced by the Youth and Moral Education Office, which consist of unique and extremely robust values-based education curricula. The youth education programs marry Kohlberg's theory of moral development with theories on the causes of corruption to shape and mold the moral identity of a Hong Kong citizen. The use of media, cartoons and television dramas produced by the ICAC, and its embrace of social media and new technologies, builds connections with its citizenry and reinforces the positive moral identity that the ICAC tries to instill.

This research contends that the combination of the theories of moral development and the theories of causes of corruption yields a strong foundation for values-based education which sustains a moral climate intolerant to corruption.

Acknowledgement

Writing this, whilst on my first mission to a conflict zone, has been a challenge both academically and personally. I am thankful for my wonderfully patient and encouraging family, friends, and thesis advisor. Without them, my early mornings would have been much more challenging. My organization has also been extremely flexible and supportive in my pursuit of higher education.

I would also like to express sincere gratitude to the Independent Commission Against Corruption, and its Community Relations Department, for granting me a study visit. Without the officers and ambassadors who graciously allowed me to interview them, I would have been unable to formulate the foundation of this research.

I thank A for giving me unending hope as I strove to finish my thesis.

But above all, I thank M for believing in the tenacity and strength in my spirit, for inspiring me on a daily basis to strive toward great heights, and for serving as a reminder that people can achieve amazing things through determination and kindness.

List of Abbreviations

AC	Anti-Corruption
ACA	Anti-corruption Agency
CRD	Community Relations Department
IACA	International Anti-Corruption Academy
ICAC	Independent Commission Against Corruption
MACS	Master in Anti-Corruption Studies

Introduction

Hong Kong's Independent Commission Against Corruption is widely respected and well-known in the anti-corruption community. Many researchers have attributed the success of ICAC to a variety of external factors, including the strength of political will or public trust in the government (Quah, 2011) (Sohmen, 1999) (Kwok, n.d.) (Chan, 2005), or factors, specific to the ICAC, such as their strong investigative capabilities, alongside ICAC's staunch independence from the Hong Kong government (Kwok, n.d.) (Quah, 2011). Given the historical background of Hong Kong's corrupt past, its rise to prominence in fighting corruption is all the more significant. While these factors do indeed contribute to the success of the ICAC, these do not necessarily account for the cultural shift that had to occur within the hearts and minds of Hong Kong's inhabitants to turn them from being members of a corrupt society to a relatively corruption-free society. However, once the shift did in fact take place, how did the ICAC ensure that future generations of Hong Kong citizens would similarly carry on the values of probity and anti-corruption?

The fostering of future generations can be attributed to the ICAC's Community Relations Department ("CRD"), whose statutory mandate is to educate the public against the evils of corruption and promote public support of their mission (Legislative Council of Hong Kong, 1974). The strength of ICAC's community outreach through its CRD is also often credited as a defining factor in its success (Scott & Gong, 2019). However, this research argues that the complexity and richness of the Youth and Moral Education Office and the work it undertakes is the true success factor in Hong Kong's anti-corruption success. This research will examine the sophisticated ways that ICAC, through its Youth and Moral Education Office, interweaves theories of moral behavioral development and causes of corruption, and applies a variety of corruption prevention systems, into its educational programs. It is an extremely robust, *all out* approach that the ICAC employs. The ICAC is blessed to have a

generous budget to carry out its work (Quah, 2011). The educational programs combine formal, in-class teaching modules with social media, community groups, and television dramas, with one main goal - to create a moral and values-driven identity within the mindset of an individual in Hong Kong.

It would be easy to distill this into a basic premise of *youth education equals anti-corruption success*. This is not necessarily the case. Hong Kong's success as a strong anti-corruption regime has just as much to do with the external factors noted above as the strength in its youth education campaign. In addition to an in-depth analysis of the youth and education program, this research paper will touch upon some of the external success factors required to lay the groundwork for a robust educational campaign, and provide historical context for the need for a significant educational campaign.

Methodology

The ICAC has changed Hong Kong from a corrupt society, in the 1970s, into a clean one in a relatively short amount of time. Although the ICAC's initial anti-corruption campaigns focused on changing the pre-existing mindset of Hong Kong's society, once the new moral climate had been established, ushering new generations into this moral climate was a different task. If youth are the future of any nation, how has the ICAC guided generations of Hong Kong citizens into possessing a strong moral character and identity? More specifically, what are the defining features of its youth anti-corruption campaigns that make it so successful?

There is a propensity for anti-corruption education campaigns to offer training courses, in which a lecturer or professional lectures for an hour to his audience. The ICAC's youth outreach program, on the other hand, is much more complex than that. This research surmises that the innovation and sophistication of its youth program is in fact where its strength and efficacy lie.

This research first looks to some theories on the causes of corruption and focuses its attention more on individual-driven causes of corruption rather than organizational corruption. Institutionally, there were necessary pre-conditions in Hong Kong prior to the success of any anti-corruption campaigns. Both the theories and the pre-conditions, or external factors, relied on pre-existing academic research on those topics. The research also relied on case studies of anti-corruption in Hong Kong, both as contextual background of the ICAC's anti-corruption regime, as well as for other academic perspectives on the successes of the ICAC. While these case studies indeed mentioned the youth-directed programs, as well as the Community Relations Department responsible for the campaigns, it is more a factual acknowledgement of the existence of these programs, rather than an analysis of the

depth and substance of the programs. Additional sources utilized in the research included interviews or conference speeches given by previous officers or commissioners of the ICAC. This was to seek an understanding of the contextual framework in which the youth programs resided among the other prevention strategies.

In order to fully understand the youth campaigns, the research conducted two sessions at the ICAC Headquarters in Hong Kong. During the first day's session, the researcher held separate interviews with officials from the Community Relations Department, the Youth and Moral Education Office, as well as the Mass Communication Office. The second day's session had a small group discussion with three ICAC Ambassadors (college students selected to bring forth ICAC's message of integrity to their campus), along with an ICAC Officer. These three ambassadors were also serving as summer interns at the ICAC Headquarters.

Limitations Experienced

A major limitation experienced during the course of the research was the inability to record the interviews held at the ICAC Headquarters. Consent for the interviews were provided via written email; however, consent to record the sessions was denied (Appendix A). Without an audio recording of the interviews, the researcher was unable to transcribe the interviews for inclusion in the Appendix. References to the interviews, or even quotations noted by the subjects of interviews, were written as notes during the course of the interview itself, and referred back to during the course of the research. Furthermore, hard copies of the PowerPoint presentations shared by the subjects of the interview were provided to the researcher following the interviews.

The ICAC also requested that the names of the officers and ambassadors be omitted in this research. Officials are only identified by their department and a unique code given by the researcher. Ambassadors were covered in the request for anonymity, and therefore, in addition to their names being coded, their university names are also not included.

During the interviews with the ambassadors, an officer from the ICAC was present in the room. There were a few select instances where the researcher posed a question to the ambassadors and the officer responded to the questions. While the opinions given by the ambassadors are not included in the body of the research, some factual points about the activities undertaken by ambassadors at their universities, presented in their PowerPoint presentations, were included in the research.

Chapter 1: Literature Review – Theories on the Causes of Corruption

When examining the various prevention initiatives undertaken by anti-corruption agencies, the underlying causality of corruption needs to be considered. Although the research theorizing causes of corruption is significant, the "explanations focus almost exclusively on system-level variables, [*and*] tell us little about the individual-level motivation to engage in a corrupt exchange" (Tavits, 2010, p. 1258). While the literature review will touch upon the theory of organizational misbehavior, this research theorizes a more individual-level focus from the ICAC's youth education programs. Therefore, the concepts of public choice theory, social learning theory, and the bad apple theory will be reviewed for their possible applicability in Hong Kong.

1.1 Organizational Misbehavior in Adults

Punch explores a predisposition toward corruption in his research on police corruption (2009), focusing on "'ordinary men' placed in a peculiar institutional context where they are asked to perform dirty work; some remain clean, some become dirty, while others revel in the dirt" (Punch, 2009, p. 2). Although the research presented is specific to corruption in the police force, some conclusions can be applied to the broader topic of the causes of corruption. Punch noted that when people become members of a group, organization or other collective, it may "demand conformity" as a member of that group (Punch, 2008, p. 103). At the extremes, it may encourage or require obedience to the group (Punch, 2008, p. 119), suppression of the individual's identity or even the creation or adoption of an entirely new identity (Punch, 2008, p. 103). The decision-making process could be influenced by the group and lead to either 'group think' or cognitive dissonance (Punch, 2008, p. 103).

Punch's observations about a group or organization's ability to persuade an individual into more deviant or corrupt behavior, appears to coincide with social learning theory (explained further below). In social learning theory, the individual reproduces the behavior of the group around them, if they perceive this behavior to be accepted and widespread (Tavits, 2010). While the emphasis in social learning theory is more on the individual rather than on organizational responsibility, Punch vehemently disagrees that corruption could be caused by an *individual failure module* (Punch, 2009, p. 239). He concludes by noting, "that corruption is an *institutional* failure. Hence, preventing and tackling corruption is about organisational and cultural change" (Punch, 2009, p. 239).

In addition to Punch, there has been increasing focus on organizational structures in order to prevent and address corruption. As Sohmen notes,

> "Corruption prevention, as part of the much larger question of ethical behavior, has also appeared on the agenda of corporate governance study groups, on the listing rules of stock exchanges, on the curricula of business schools, and on the brief of human resource departments in large companies and industry associations." (1999, p. 872)

To posit that organizations should set the agenda of corruption prevention and to absolve the individual of responsibilities in its decisions toward corrupt acts seems in itself to be an irresponsible assumption. In the decision to undertake corrupt behavior, there must be some level of interaction between the organization and the individual. Furthermore, the organizational examples listed above, including corporations and businesses, stock exchanges, institutions for higher educations and industry associations, (Sohmen, 1999, p. 872), are notably comprised of adult individuals, capable of making ethical decisions. These organizations, rather than the adult members of such organizations, are currently the focus of many anti-corruption agendas (Sohmen, 1999, p. 872).

Thomas Chan, former Director of Corruption Prevention at the Commission, contended that, "Corruption prevention is an organisational, as well as individual, ethical responsibility. While corruption depends on individuals, it may be unwittingly encouraged or protected by certain features of an organisation's activities or structural deficiencies" (Chan, 1999, p. 376). This research agrees with the notion that both the individual and the organization bear some degree of responsibility to uphold and disseminate the agenda of corruption prevention. However, the degree of responsibility is greater in the individual, rather than the organization.

1.2 Individual Motivation – Public Choice Theory

In contrast to organizational misbehavior and responsibility, public choice theory focuses on the "level of the individual" (de Graaf, 2007, p. 46), who is considered to make decisions based on his egoistic, yet rational nature (Mbaku, 2008). While the origins of public choice theory lay in the behavior of politicians against public policy, its general application toward corruption can easily be made (Mbaku, 2008). As the theory contends, an individual elects to maximize his utility through rational calculations and choices (de Graaf, 2007, p. 46). Whether that individual is a politician or a mainstream citizen, the maximization of one's utility is a characteristic shared by many. Underpinning the rational choice of utility is Susan Rose-Ackerman's notion that the perceived benefits of corrupt behavior outweigh the perceived chances of being caught (de Graaf, 2007, p. 47). Further supporting this cost-benefit calculation, is Klitgaard's equation, where the calculation of "the benefits of corruption minus the probability of being caught times its penalties" (de Graaf, 2007, p. 47) influences one's decision whether to engage in corrupt behavior. If the benefit is greater than the potential of being caught, "then an individual will rationally choose to be corrupt"

(de Graaf, 2007, p. 47). The question of rationality is not fully addressed or explored, but merely assumed. This assumption of individuals or organizations being rational agents capable of making rational choices is common to economic theories (Amir, et al., 2005).

While public choice theory begins at the "moment an official calculates whether to become corrupt or not" (de Graaf, 2007, p. 48), it seemingly overlooks the obvious question of: if the calculation and equation is similar among individuals, why do some people choose to be corrupt, while others do not? (de Graaf, 2007, p. 48). Public choice theory stops short of theorizing why the same cost-benefit calculation may yield different results with different people.

1.3 Individual Motivation – Social Learning Theory

An "alternative explanation of individual motivation to engage in corrupt behavior" can be explained through social learning theory (Tavits, 2010). Social learning theory, at its core, is the combination of behavioral learning theory and cognitive learning theory (Psychology Today, n.d.). In simplified definitions, behavioral learning theory suggests that environmental stimuli influence an individual's learning, whereas cognitive learning theory suggest psychological factors influence learning (Psychology Today, n.d.). In social learning theory, four factors for learning were identified by psychologist Albert Bandura – observation, retention, reproduction, and motivation (Psychology Today, n.d.). Children, therefore, observe a behavior and ultimately reproduce such behavior (Psychology Today, n.d.). Behavior, as described by Akers (2009), is acquired by an individual's association and imitation of peers' behaviors, and sustained through the "positive reinforcement provided by past rewards for such

behavior" (Tavits, 2010, p. 1260). Tavits suggests that people are more likely to engage in a certain behavior, if people perceive that the behavior is approved and widespread (2010, p. 1260). Although this does not suggest causality of individual behavior, these factors have an overlapping and reinforcing relationship (Tavits, 2010, p. 1260).

When applying the social learning theory specifically to corruption,

> "a person is expected to engage in corrupt behavior if he or she does not define corruption as morally or situationally wrong, but rather as a justified and acceptable mode for exchange; and if he or she has been exposed to corrupt behavior or at least perceives that such a behavior is widespread and, thus, approved" (Tavits, 2010, p. 1261).

Tavits empirically tested social learning theory regarding corrupt behavior among both public officials and citizens in Estonia (Tavits, 2010, p. 1272). The empirical models showed that both public officials and citizens were "motivated by their perception of what is acceptable and commonplace" (Tavits, 2010, p. 1272). The acceptability of corruption and perceived pervasiveness of corruption, as hypothesized, resulted in a "statistically significant effect on the likelihood of having paid a bribe" (Tavits, 2010, p. 1270). If an official perceived corruption to be widespread, it may influence his own decision to similarly pay a bribe.

Tavits' empirical study focuses on the elements of corrupt behavior being learned through peer or societal approval of such behavior. This does, however, beg the question of whether social learning theory could be applied to the inverse of corrupt behavior. Specifically, could ethical or non-corrupt behavior be reinforced through positive and ethical peer associations? And when re-applying social learning theory to children, could the introduction of positive role models similarly influence a child's behavior to act accordingly?

1.4 Individual Motivation – Bad Apple Theory

Another theory for consideration is the bad apple theory, which looks to the individual's "defective human character and predisposition toward criminal activity" (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49) to explain the causes of corruption. In other words, some people are simply born or raised to act criminally (Pertiwi, 2018). The element of greed, described as a human weakness by de Graaf (2007, p. 49), is what drives an individual's corrupt acts. Other studies have shown a host of individual characteristics that people may possess, which may make them more prone to corruption. In Pertiwi's research, he lists several other characteristics, including ambition (Jackall 1998), low empathy (Detert, et al, 2008), male versus female, younger versus older people (O'Fallon and Butterfield 2005), or even less religious versus more religious people (Singhapakdi, et al, 2000) (2018, p. 4). There appears to be no single characteristic that can wholly determine why an individual would choose to be corrupt, when those around him are not. However, when an assumption is made that morality determines one's behavior (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49), this presupposes that "'wrong' values are therefore the cause of corruption" (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49).In recent years, bad apple theories have lost their popularity as a cause of corruption (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49). It has become insufficient to argue that weak moral character or possession of the wrong values directly influences corrupt behavior (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49). However, the question remains: could strong moral character serve as a deterrent to corrupt behavior? If the underlying questions of how one "[acquired] these moral vices" (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49), or whether the corrupt individual possessed a predisposition toward corruption (de Graaf, 2007, p. 49), are largely overlooked with the bad apple theories, could moral education serve to sway or influence vices or predispositions?

1.5 Conclusion: Literature Review

This research will revisit some of the theories of the causes of corruption, as it relates to Hong Kong and the ICAC's strategy. However, the theories selected and noted within the literature review are to provide context into further discussion on the ICAC's seemingly individualistic view of corruption and anti-corruption.

Chapter 2: Background of Hong Kong's Independent Anti-Corruption Commission

The Hong Kong Independent Anti-Corruption Commission ("ICAC" or "the Commission") was established in 1974 and is generally considered one of the most successful anti-corruption agencies in the world (Chan, 2005, p. 95) (Quah, 2011) (Scott & Gong, 2019). Prior to the establishment of ICAC and in Hong Kong's early days, corruption was rampant and "'tea money' or 'convenience money' [paid] to government servants" was commonplace and generally expected in daily life (Chan, 2005, pp. 96, 97).

Before the Commission, Hong Kong possessed the legal framework to prevent corruption. As early as 1898, the Misdemeanors Punishment Ordinance against bribery was enacted (Chan, 2005, p. 96) (Wu, 2006, p. 1), which was subsequently followed by the Prevention of Corruption Ordinance in 1948 (Chan, 2005, p. 96), and the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance in 1955 (Manion, 2004). However, these were largely unsuccessful pieces of legislation at the time (Skidmore, 1996, p. 120). Syndicated corruption was embedded both "within and outside the [police] force" (Wu, 2006, p. 1). As the police were responsible for investigating corruption, people often did not report complaints for fear they would be reporting to a corrupt police officer (Wu, 2006, p. 1). With significant public unrest between 1956 and 1967, Hong Kong was embroiled in riots and protests, fueled by "social and economic inequities" (Skidmore, 1996, pp. 120-121). This prompted the British government to act and assume more responsibility over local Hong Kong affairs (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121).

In 1971, when the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance became effective, it was described as "one of the toughest pieces of legislation in Hong Kong's history" (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121). The ordinance, akin to today's unexplained wealth orders,

criminalized the possession of assets greater than a crown servant's income, unless that excess was properly explained (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121). The traditional concept of "[innocent] until proven guilty" (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121) was reversed, placing the burden of proof of the legality of one's assets on the accused. However, the authority to investigate and enforce the unexplained wealth ordinance still resided with the Anti-Corruption Branch within the police force (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121).

Corruption, including police involvement in said corruption, was the status quo when a major catalyst ignited in 1973. Peter Fitzroy Godber, a distinguished Chief Superintendent of Police, was investigated for maintaining a balance in his foreign accounts of $4.377 million Hong Kong Dollars, which was six times greater than his total salary from the police force over last twenty years (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121) (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 31). Three days later, allegedly with help within the police force, Godber managed to escape Hong Kong to Great Britain (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121) (Wu, 2006, p. 1) (Chan, 2005, p. 97) (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 31). Following Godber's escape, young people and students took to the streets for a number of protests and street demonstrations, demanding anti-corruption reform (Chan, 2005, p. 97).

The demonstrations and outrage by the public were so resounding that a commission of inquiry was appointed by the government, headed by Justice Alastair Blair-Kerr (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121). The commission's first report confirmed that Godber's successful escape utilized knowledge of airport security, not with the assistance of anyone on the police force (Skidmore, 1996, p. 121). The commission's second report recommended anti-corruption authority be transferred away from the police (Skidmore, 1996, p. 122). Thus, on February 15, 1974, with the Independent Commission Against Corruption Ordinance ("ICAC Ordinance"), Governor MacLehose and Justice Blair-Kerr established the Independent Commission Against Corruption

(Wu, 2006, p. 2) (Chan, 2005, p. 97). The following year, Godber was extradited back to Hong Kong, tried, and imprisoned for his crimes (Chan, 2005, p. 97).

This research would be remiss if, during the retelling of the history of the ICAC's creation, it overlooked the direct connection between large-scale student protests of Godber's escape and the creation of the ICAC. That youth and the student population were able to drive incredible amounts of change is significant in itself. During the course of this research, the student and young adult population has been similarly leading the charge to drive change in Hong Kong. During the formation of the Youth and Moral Education Office, and the focus on youth anti-corruption education, the ICAC must have either innately or overtly recognized the significance of the youth and their ability to drive change and influence a population.

2.1 Strategy and approach for ICAC

At the time of Skidmore's publication in 1996, there were only a handful of dedicated anti-corruption agencies in existence, including Singapore, Malaysia, and New South Wales in Australia (p. 122). Today, that list is significantly longer. However, dedicated, independent, anti-corruption agencies are still not the norm. The success of Hong Kong's anti-corruption agency can be attributed to several factors, but Skidmore, who categorized the ICAC as being "unique" (1996, p. 122), noted Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance which required the maintenance of community relations as a distinct characteristic (1996, pp. 122-123). In Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance, under 'Duties of the Commissioner', the Commissioner is mandated to "educate the public against the evils of corruption" and "enlist and foster public support in combatting corruption" (Legislative Council of Hong Kong, 1974).

While the enlistment and fostering of public support sounds simply like rallying the public to one's cause, the reality is much more complex and challenging. Although social unrest and a large corruption scandal prompted the creation of the Commission, the broader population still heavily relied on convenience money to smooth transactions. As a former Commissioner of the ICAC noted, "Anticorruption is concerned with upholding a value, a value that says bribery is wrong and is a serious criminal offense" (de Speville, 2016, p. 117). With Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance, the ICAC Commissioner is tasked with the monumental mandate of changing the moral fabric of the population, its citizens' attitude toward corruption, and instilling values that corruption is wrong.

In 1974, when the Commission was formed, dedicated national anti-corruption strategies and independent anti-corruption agencies were just a dream. The articles of the UN Convention Against Corruption ("UNCAC") were decades from being realized. As Bertrand de Speville, former Commissioner of the ICAC (1992-1996), has previously noted, "Tackling corruption requires a strategy comprising three elements: investigation, prevention, and public education and support" (2016, p. 121). This strategy, now universally recognized as the three-pronged approach, which has been solidified in the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (de Speville, 2016, p. 117), "aims at upholding the community's value that corruption is wrong" (de Speville, 2016, p. 117). Since its inception, the ICAC has operated under this well-known three-pronged approach to corruption prevention, which places equal strategic importance on prevention, investigation, and education (Chan, 1999, p. 367).

Prevention of corruption within organizations through examination of their operations and proposals for "corruption-resistant management and administration systems" (Chan, 1999, p. 367) are the mandate and responsibility of the Corruption Prevention Department.

The Operations Department, the most visible and largest component of the Commission, receives complaints and undertakes the responsibility of investigation and enforcement (Chan, 1999, p. 367) (GovHK, 2019, p. 620). There was a need to balance the public trust in the Commission's high-profile investigations targeting corrupt officials (Sohmen, 1999, p. 871), with the

> "failure to pursue offenders except where the evidence is incontrovertible not only carries the same risk, but will additionally create doubts about the effectiveness of the anti-corruption agency's work and about a government's commitment that adherence to the rule of law is uppermost on its national agenda." (Sohmen, 1999, p. 871)

While important, simply focusing on investigations and prevention can be likened to treating only the symptoms, but not the corrupt disease itself (Chan, 2005, p. 98). The public trust that the Commission needed to gain in the 1970s, and maintain through the years, has been the responsibility of the third department of the ICAC – The Community Relations Department.

2.2 Community Relations Department and the moral climate of Hong Kong

The third prong of the Commission's strategy focuses heavily on "introducing to society across the board a new clean and honest culture in place of the old corruption-tolerant one" (Chan, 2005, p. 98). Having a Community Relations Department, along with its mandate of educating the public about corruption and fostering support around anti-corruption, was almost unheard of at the time ICAC was created (Chan, 2005, p. 98). A major shift needed to take place in the culture and mindset of the people in Hong Kong during a time when corruption was commonplace (Chan, 2005) (Quah, 2011). Not only would ICAC need to win over the hearts and minds of Hong Kong citizens, but also build and foster trust in the ICAC (Chan, 2005, p. 104). Citing

Clark's comparative research between Chicago and Hong Kong's anti-corruption movements, Skidmore noted that if a

> "moral climate can be created then so much greater will be the prospects for controlling corruption. Even where there is a measure of popular disapproval this will have little impact on actual behaviour if this disapproval is not given institutional expression and full support by top officials." (1996, p. 123)

If ICAC could get the Hong Kong population to trust them, could Hong Kong rise to the challenge of strengthening its rule of law to successfully investigate and prosecute corrupt actors? Could the ICAC, effectively, create a moral climate intolerant to corruption?

The creation of a moral climate intolerant to corruption undeniably needs the participation and approval of broader society. Article 13, Section c of UNCAC, ratified in China and Hong Kong in 2006[i], twenty-two years after ICAC's inception (Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2018), refers to the participation of society and requires, "undertaking public information activities that contribute to nontolerance of corruption, as well as public education programmes, including school and university curricula" (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004, p. 15). Through its sophisticated community education campaigns, the ICAC was able to shift societal views of corruption (Chan, 2005, p. 95). People began to think of corruption as a social evil unnecessary to achieve favourable commercial or bureaucratic results (Sohmen, 1999, p. 872).

Preceding UNCAC's Article 13, was Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance. Section 12 outlines the statutory duties of the Commissioner as "[educating] the public against the evils of corruption" and "[enlisting] public support in combating corruption" (Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2016). The Community Relations Department carries out this mandate as a statutory duty. One

of the strategies employed by the Community Relations Department is the adoption of an "Ethics for All" (Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2016) approach for preventative education programs. By adopting this "Ethics for All" (Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2016) strategy, ICAC fosters a moral climate that is intolerant to corruption. In 2017, ICAC's "Ethics for All" program was able to reach "over 820,000 people and 1,600 organisations" (Wong, 2019, p. 151) through partnerships with 830 organizations to spread and reinforce the message of probity within the communities (Wong, 2019, p. 151). In 2018, in the Annual Survey conducted by ICAC, on a scale of 0 to 10, 84.7% of the 1,518 persons interviewed rated themselves at a 0, meaning having a total intolerance to corruption (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019d). Tolerance of corruption in Hong Kong had a mean score of 0.5, its lowest recorded level since the survey began in 1990, meaning an almost complete intolerance to corruption (IC1, Appendix B) (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019d).

At some point, when a general intolerance to corruption in Hong Kong was reached, the focus needed to be shifted from changing the existing culture to fostering and maintaining a new ethical culture.

Chapter 3: Anti-corruption reform and prevention

Hong Kong has moved from what the ICAC refers to as the *dark old days* (IC2, Appendix B) of corruption, to one of the top anti-corruption jurisdictions in the world. This research has reviewed the historical context of Hong Kong's Independent Commission Against Corruption, which showed the need for a large-scale cultural change during the 1970s. This cultural change and the upholding of a new culture of probity was and continues to be a statutory obligation set forth in Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance (Legislative Council of Hong Kong, 1974). The ICAC Commissioner is charged with "[educating] the public" on corruption and building support around the anti-corruption agenda (Legislative Council of Hong Kong, 1974). Armed with its team of experts in education, public relations, and ethics (Kwok, 2006, p. 199), that's exactly what the ICAC's Community Relations Department set out to do – educate the public and build support for the anti-corruption agenda.

While adult education and reform played a more critical role in the early days of the Commission, as the societal culture began to change, the needs of the adult population inevitably shifted from education to confirmation or reinforcement. To make sustainable changes for the future, the ICAC needed to ensure future generations were educated from the start. When the ICAC launched the Public Education Unit in 1974, it strategized how to groom and shape children into the kind of adults who valued integrity, honesty, and fairness (IC2, Appendix B). This monumental task of creating future generations of moral and ethical individuals without the propensity for corruption could not be achieved through something as simple as one-hour classroom lectures. Through the years, the ICAC has developed a robust education campaign centered around Hong Kong's youth. The education campaigns have quickly embraced the use of new media and technology to stay

relevant and deliver ICAC's message to the youth (IC4, Appendix B). It is this research's belief that an oft overlooked and perhaps underestimated factor in Hong Kong's success in probity and moral identity through the generations has been through its youth anti-corruption campaigns run by the Youth and Moral Education Office. But then, this begs the question, what exactly makes the youth campaigns so successful? Is there a formula for that success, and if so, can it be emulated by other jurisdictions?

This research would be remiss if it suggested that the youth program was an independent factor to Hong Kong and ICAC's success. There are a series of other syndromes and external factors in place which allowed the anti-corruption agenda and the youth programs to thrive. Therefore, in addition to analyzing the complexities of the youth program, this research will also touch upon the external factors that support the success of Hong Kong's broader anti-corruption agenda.

3.1 Prevention and causes of corruption

As one Hong Kong legislator noted,

> "Corruption prevention, as part of the much larger question of ethical behavior, has also appeared on the agenda of corporate governance study groups, on the listing rules of stock exchanges, on the curricula of business schools, and on the brief of human resource departments in large companies and industry associations." (Sohmen, 1999, p. 872)

However, the prevention examples above, study groups and listing rules, may not have the intended effect when adult individuals are faced with ethical dilemmas. Corporate governance as an agenda item or stock exchange listing rules may sound good as recent buzzwords in the business and professional world, but does it address the root cause of the corruption problem? Would a company's code of conduct address the root cause of corruption so much so that it in fact prevents corruption

from occurring? Those who believe in compliance-based prevention may argue that it could.

In reforming society's views and creating an effective, long term corruption prevention strategy, a combination of factors must be taken into consideration. As Johnston argues, "Reform thus has critical social dimensions: laws and procedures must be *seen to be* consistent with cultural values and conceptions of fairness and legitimate authority. So must the responses expected of citizens" (2005, p. 197). The rule of law, or perception thereof, along with the societal culture must work in tandem the natural inclinations of its citizens. In Johnston's views, for anti-corruption measures to be sustainable, this combination of the societal factors and strength of character within the individual core must be in place.

> "Long term strategy requires careful thought about what is possible, often as intermediate steps. Building the institutional foundations and political constituencies reform measures require, enabling societies to withstand the corruption they experience, and shifting it over time toward less disruptive varieties are more appropriate goals, and more sustainable in the long run, than aiming directly at sizeable reductions in corruption." (Johnston, 2005, p. 199)

However, this begs the question, how does a government enable its citizens or the society "to withstand the corruption they experience"? (Johnston, 2005, p. 199).

As discussed in the Literature Review, there are theories that point to the individualistic nature of corruption. These may include public choice theory, social learning theory, and bad apples theory, but often these theories alone do not lead to strategic or policy changes within an anti-corruption commission or jurisdiction (de Graaf, 2007, p. 50). If these theories attempt to explain the motivation for an individual to commit a corrupt act, can government address individual behaviors to guide them in a direction of ethical, uncorrupt behavior? However, as de Graaf notes,

> "I know of no study combining theories on individual motives for corruption with public administration and concrete suggestions for corruption control.

> When the root cause of corruption is sought in human weaknesses, 'strong moral values' are named as an antidote, but designing a policy to combat corruption with this medicine seems improbable." (2007, p. 50)

If "strong moral values" are the antidote to human weakness (de Graaf, 2007, p. 50), how would an anti-corruption agency or a government ensure that those values are innate to its population? Where de Graaf sees moral education as an improbable solution to corruption, this research looks towards the ICAC's moral and values-based outreach, specifically campaigns designed to target the youth population of Hong Kong. It seems only logical for an ACA to work with the youth population in order to offer guidance in moral education.

3.2 Corruption prevention systems

In a newly published book by Ian Scott and Ting Gong entitled *Corruption Prevention and Governance in Hong Kong,* the authors analyze in depth the success factors of Hong Kong's Independent Commission Against Corruption (2019), against the backdrop of the different approaches to corruption prevention utilized by both the ICAC and other anti-corruption agencies (Scott & Gong, 2019).

> Scott and Gong begin with a rather stark statement:
>
> "There are estimated to be more than 150 anti-corruption agencies (ACAs) around the world…Yet the evidence suggests that many agencies are failures, at least if assessed in terms of their formal purpose. In the worst cases, governments have used ACAs to oppress opponents and facilitate even greater corruption." (2019, p. 1)

However bleak that introduction may be, it is rooted in fact. Scott and Gong's review of corruption prevention approaches recognize cultural, political, and other external factors specific to the agency and its locality (2019, p. 1). In no way does it suggest

a transferrable framework or a list of best practices to be emulated from one anti-corruption agency to another (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 1).

The authors believe there are two main categories of corruption prevention strategies that different anti-corruption agencies employ – a values-based approach and a compliance-based approach (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 4). As Scott and Gong explain,

> "If we conceive of these approaches as a continuum with value-based approaches at one end and compliance-based approaches at the other, an ideal-type value-based approach would rest on the assumption that violation of social norms, such as honesty and integrity, was a moral impossibility and that, consequently, no corruption offences could be committed. At the other end of the continuum, an ideal-type compliance-based approach would depend on legal provisions that were so well constructed and so effectively implemented that anyone who committed an offence would be caught and that no one would therefore violate the law." (2019, p. 4)

Corruption prevention approaches rarely fall strictly on one end or the other of the continuum that Scott and Gong describes above, and often comprises of a combination of the values-based and compliance-based approaches (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 4).

Values-based approaches address how an individual would respond when faced with ethical dilemmas, and its corruption prevention strategies therefore focus on bolstering individual morality and maintaining alignment with the beliefs and practices in society (Scott & Gong, 2019). In successful values-based corruption prevention systems, i.e. the United Kingdom, Scandinavia, Australia, New Zealand, and the Netherlands, the common and often cited critical element is that of social trust (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 5). As derived from research from Rothstein and Eek, people's trust in the government or authorities have an influence on their perceptions and in turn creates a "more trusting society" (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 5). Susan Rose-Ackerman expands on this by theorizing that more trusting societies often share a

set of common values and are in turn less likely to be corrupt (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 5). The connection between public trust and anti-corruption will be discussed further the coming sections. Values-based approaches seek to create awareness around the responsibility and integrity of the individual when faced with ethical dilemmas or decision-making (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 7). While there is that element of personal responsibility, it is not necessarily independent of the societal expectations placed on the individual. Parts of the values-based teaching that ICAC delivers, places focus on the individual's moral responsibility in terms of staying within society's status quo and emphasizing a personal responsibility in maintaining social order. This is discussed in further detail in Chapter 6.

Conversely, compliance-based approaches are more focused on a framework of rules and the punishments or sanctions when those rules are breached (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 4). Compliance-based prevention systems comprise of codes of conduct, policies and procedures, and systems of controls (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 7). This is the approach adopted within most organizations to provide adequate organizational cover, as well as to provide a developed framework of disciplinary actions in the event of non-compliance (Scott & Gong, 2019, pp. 7, 8). Because most anti-corruption agencies are set up specifically to enforce anti-corruption legislation, there is a tendency is to have more compliance-based corruption prevention systems in place as the main prevention mechanism (Scott & Gong, 2019). From the anti-corruption agency or law enforcement's perspective, it is presumed that there is a deterrent effect where the pursuit and punishment of the corrupt will reduce future acts of corruption (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). Punishment or sanctions can only act as an effective deterrent if it is commensurate with the underlying breach or consistently applied to offenders. While criminalization of anti-corruption offenses has been shown to be an effective deterrent of corruption (Koehler, 2012), this

assumes that the jurisdiction in fact has the adequate rule of law for to uphold the criminal legislation.

Specifically, many governments in Asia tend to adopt compliance-based approaches to corruption prevention, which emphasizes the expectation that individuals *do the right thing* on the basis of following the ethical codes or procedures set in place (Scott & Gong, 2019, pp. 7, 8). Of course, this approach is only effective if individuals elect to follow the rules. According to Roberts' research, assuming individuals inherently choose to follow the rules, one of the advantages of compliance-based approaches is the reduction in the personal discretion involved in making ethical decisions (Scott & Gong, 2019). The reduction of personal discretion involved in decision-making seems to suggest that the decision to follow rules is innate or has been internalized with the individuals. Then the question remains – how do you influence someone to follow the rules? Can the decision to follow the rules be influenced or encouraged?

Because the range of ethical dilemmas one faces can be endless, there will never be a specific rule or policy that covers every type of breach (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). Without a formal rule in place, this may in turn lead to the development of informal rules (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). Informal rules could result in two vastly different outcomes (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). On the one hand, informal rules may add clarity to the behavior in question (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). On the extreme other hand, it may exacerbate the situation as the individual seeks to circumvent the pre-existing rules (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). The natural inclination is to create more rules to encompass every scenario and possible breach; however, the complication and addition of more rules does not necessarily have the intended effect of promoting compliance and hindering the corrupt act (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). The compliance-based approach presupposes that the choice to follow rules has been internalized

within the individual, and that the individual would choose to follow the rules rather than face detection and punishment. But then, this begs the question – is the concept of following rules reinforced by the individual's personal integrity and/or his perceived duty to maintain the societal status quo?

Or, worded in a different manner, should there be a values-based foundation that needs to be in place, before an individual will choose to adhere to compliance-based approaches? The reverse, with compliance preceding values, seems to not hold true. Scott and Gong similarly draw the conclusion that, "Once a compliance-based system is in place, it also seems to become more difficult to integrate value-based elements into the ethical framework" (2019, p. 8). This could lead to the oversimplified conclusion that if we first teach values, then compliance to rules will follow. However, research conducted by Roberts and Brewer found that there appears to be a "tendency to turn values into rules, mistrusting individuals to arrive at appropriate answers" (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 8). Trusting that individuals will arrive at the appropriate responses when faced with ethical dilemmas in effect suggests that moral values need to be internalized within the individual in order to be effective in compliance-based prevention.

In looking at the case study of Hong Kong and the ICAC, it appears that both compliance-based and values-based prevention systems are utilized, albeit targeted at different ages and facets of society. Although not explored within the scope of this research, the researcher would highlight that the ICAC also undertakes a considerable effort in compliance-based prevention. The Corruption Prevention Department works primarily with businesses and organizations in strengthening their system of controls. ICAC's tertiary (university-level) and adult education also focuses on a compliance-based approach, through its teachings on ethics, including the adherence to codes of ethics, in an academic or professional setting.

Preceding these compliance-based approaches are the values-based education that Hong Kong citizens have been exposed to since childhood. The ICAC's values-based education begins at pre-primary or kindergarten level and continues through a student's tertiary education (IC2 & IC3, Appendix B), and does not include the teaching of rules for an individual to adhere to and abide by. Instead the focus is on the integrity and values that support an individual's decision-making capacity. Therefore, Roberts and Brewer's research, noting the tendency to morph values into rules, is not necessarily relevant to Hong Kong. Instead, the values serve as a guide to the ethical decision-making of the individual.

As an ACA, the ICAC is able to deploy a "universal model" (Scott & Gong, 2019, pp. 8, 9) to provide adequate attention and coverage for the different motivations behind corruption. Heilbrunn's universal model comprises a zero-tolerance approach (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 9) and includes, as quoted by Heilbrunn, aspects of "investigative, preventative, and communication" (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 9). However, because of the breadth and scope of the universal model, this proves to be an extremely costly endeavour (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 9). As will be discussed in the next chapter, the ICAC is fortunate to have strong support from the Hong Kong SAR government, which yields a healthy operating budget from which to draw. The budget supports ICAC's robust, universal model, as well as the deployment and emphasis of both compliance-based and values-based corruption prevention systems. Although these are merely the means by which it disseminates its strategy, societal factors inherent to Hong Kong also support the success of the ICAC.

Chapter 4: Factors contributing to Hong Kong's success

In Quah's *Curbing Corruption in Asian Countries: An Impossible Dream?,* the historical context of Hong Kong is analyzed in conjunction with an evaluation of global indicators that support Hong Kong's success in anti-corruption (2011). The concluding remarks from his chapter on Hong Kong identify several factors for success for both Hong Kong and the Independent Commission Against Corruption (Quah, 2011). When identifying a jurisdiction's formula for success in combatting corruption, external or societal factors are often cited. As Quah notes, former ICAC Commissioner from 2006 - 2007, Fanny Law, cites four strengths which contribute to Hong Kong's strong system of integrity:

> "a strong political will to curb corruption; a common integrity framework for civil servants, politicians, judicial officers, and staff of the watchdog agencies, a vibrant civil society with independent media and non-governmental organizations; and an independent ICAC with a comprehensive anti-corruption program" (2011, p. 264).

While these factors indeed contribute to Hong Kong's success, are they in fact unique to Hong Kong? If not, given the above factors, could other jurisdictions successfully emerge from a corrupt society as Hong Kong did? Could they not only emerge from the dark old days, but thrive in a new values-driven moral climate of integrity?

4.1 Political will and the need for adequate funding

While very few would dispute that the path to anti-corruption could be done without the political will and support of a jurisdiction's leadership (Johnston, 2018), it is not enough to say it is merely the existence or strength of that political will that drives the fight against corruption. Strong political will for the anti-corruption cause does not necessarily preclude widespread corruption. As Johnston rightly notes, some

seemingly strong shows of political will for anti-corruption movements or reforms could be just that – for show, or as political revenge targeting critics or the opposition (Johnston, 2018). The overzealous or excessive strength of political will, often coupled with weak institutions, can also be seen in extremely corrupt countries or societies (Johnston, 2018). Conversely, Hong Kong possesses both strong institutions and *strong enough* political will to combat corruption, which has continued after the handover from British rule in 1997 (Scott & Gong, 2019). Although political will must be present to combat corruption, this research does not necessarily view political will as a strength, as former Commissioner Law notes (Quah, 2011, p. 24), but rather as a precondition required to gain or foster public trust (Buscaglia & van Dijk, 2005, p. 25).

However, the feasibility of implementing political will into actionable reforms will inevitably face the challenge of having adequate resources and a sufficient budget. As summarized by Quah, Bertrand de Speville, former ICAC Commissioner from 1993 – 1996, noted that "the most important factor" in anti-corruption (2011, p. 265) is the combination of government's recognition of the seriousness of corruption and the "provision of adequate resources to deal with it" (Quah, 2011, p. 265). During times of strong political will against corruption, budgetary constraints should not be an issue. Indeed, if the government did not allocate an adequate budget to address the corruption problem, could it even justify its strong, supportive stance? However, with a change in government or when political will declines and government is "at odds with" (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 66) the anti-corruption agency, then funding for the agency may come under pressure or decline (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 66).

The ICAC has been fortunate to consistently benefit from the support of the Hong Kong SAR government. Many government agencies suffered from budget cuts resulting from lower GDP during Hong Kong's handover to China in 1997 and the

subsequent Asian financial crises (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 66). In contrast, the Independent Commission Against Corruption's budget actually increased 44% between 1996 and 2000 (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 66), which allowed the ICAC to address the increase in corruption complaints before and after the handover in 1997 (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 66). Former Deputy Commissioner and Head of Operations of ICAC, Tony Kwok Man-wai, has been quoted as stating,

> "The ICAC is probably one of the most expensive anti-corruption agencies in the world! In 2002, its annual budget amounted to US$90M, about US$15 per capita…it represents only 0.3% of the entire Government budget or 0.05% of [the] Hong Kong Gross Domestic Product (GDP)." (Kwok, 2006, p. 201)

Today, in the 2019-2020 budget year, ICAC's provision is approximately 1,167.7 million Hong Kong Dollars[ii] (GovHK, 2019). With an estimated population of 7.5 million people (Census and Statistics Department , 2019), ICAC's budget per capita can be calculated as approximately 156 Hong Kong Dollars per person or $19.87 USD[iii]. Given the recent extradition-related protests in Hong Kong and the current trade war between US and China causing sharply revised 2019 GDP estimates (Yau, 2019), this research is unable to reach an estimated percentage of ICAC budget to government budget or GDP as Tony Kwok Man-wai has done for 2002 figures. Nonetheless, it is safe to presume that the ICAC budget would still comprise significantly less than 1% or even 0.5% of both.

4.2 Integrity frameworks and public trust of civil servants

An adequate and robust budget can only prove as effective as the civil servants who are entrusted to deliver on the government's plans and strategies. Fanny Law cites a "common integrity framework" (Quah, 2011, p. 264) as one of Hong Kong's strengths in maintaining its strong system of integrity. Integrity frameworks can be similar or

even interchangeable with codes of ethics or codes of conducts. Noting that integrity frameworks act as a strength of Hong Kong suggests an importance placed on a compliance-based prevention approach. However, describing the integrity framework as being *common* to the various levels of civil service is an interesting distinction. It perhaps suggests a different outcome when integrity frameworks are not similarly or equally adopted across the different facets of civil service. This research believes that different integrity frameworks applied across the different civil services could unintentionally or indirectly imply to its citizens that the level of integrity depends on the position a civil servant occupies. For example, the integrity of a judge should differ from that of a police officer or a postal worker. The specific phrasing of *common integrity framework* could imply a common minimum level of integrity or conduct that the Hong Kong population expects from across its civil service. The minimum level of integrity may equate to whether the population instills a level of trust in its civil servants. In research emanating from Sharjah, United Arab Emirates, the concept of public trust was described as not only a "constitutional description of public office" (Anon., 2017), but also a place "where public officers and employees commonly known as civil servants and public officials must be at all times" (Anon., 2017). The anonymous writer continues by offering a reminder that civil servants are accountable to the citizens, and "should serve with utmost responsibility, integrity, loyalty and efficiency" (2017).

As researched by Anderson and Tverdova in 2003, public trust in civil service has been shown to have an inverse relationship with corruption (Lambsdorff, 2007, p. 31). The existence of corruption "significantly reduces trust in civil servants" (Lambsdorff, 2007, p. 31). Therefore, could the conduct of the civil servants yield some kind of impact on the conduct of the citizens they serve? This is beautifully summarized by the anonymous writer from Skyline University College in Sharjah:

> "Civil servants often have liberty on how they serve the public. Their ability in implementing the rules to provide public services has always a significant impact on the common citizens. The code of conduct and ethical standard for public officials and employees is set forth to promote high ethical standards in providing public services." (2017)

The decision of "how [civil servants] serve the public" (Anon., 2017) inevitably affects public trust in the civil servants themselves, but also perhaps the perception of the integrity or the perceived levels of corruption in the institutions in which the civil servants serve. The erosion of public trust causes corruption and the perception of corruption, and conversely corruption and the perception of corruption causes an erosion of public trust; this has been researched in the context of Mexico by Morris and Klesner (2010). The causalities between public trust, corruption, and perception are not the purpose of this research, but this merely serves to acknowledge the research done, which concludes this phenomena as both having "mutual causality" and "a vicious circle that perpetuates corruption, the perception of corruption, and low levels of trust" (Morris & Klesner, 2010, p. 1275).

Returning to the previous description, public trust is a place where civil servants, public officers and officials "must be at all time" (Anon., 2017). Therefore, the inverse should also be applicable. Public distrust and the consequences of that distrust are not where civil servants, et al., should be. Morris and Klesner recognized the unique connection between public trust and corruption, and noted:

> "…corruption undermines faith in the institutions to do what they are supposed to do – such as administer a government service – but also, by undermining faith in government in general and politicians and civil servants in particular, that corruption undermines the people's confidence in the ability of the government itself to fight corruption." (2010, p. 1275)

The ICAC also recognized this unavoidable connection between public trust and corruption. Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance spells out the duties of the

Commissioner, which includes the enlistment and fostering of "public support in combatting corruption" (Legislative Council of Hong Kong, 1974). Through its statutory requirement, by law, ICAC is required to win the public's trust in combatting corruption. The decision undertaken by the authors of the ICAC Ordinance appears to acknowledge the critical factor that public trust must be won in order to "effectively address the problem" (Morris & Klesner, 2010, p. 1276) of corruption. The ICAC appears to be successful in its campaign to win public trust of Hong Kong's citizens; this can be gauged by public confidence in the ICAC. Wu cites a consistent decline in the number of anonymous complaints received by the ICAC as indicative of the increase in public trust of the ICAC (2006, p. 3).

4.3 Press and other freedoms in Hong Kong

Preceding the formation of the ICAC, during Godber's flight from Hong Kong, citizens, most notably "students and young people" (Chan, 2005, p. 97), took to the streets to demand justice with the slogan: "Fight Corruption, Catch Godber" (Chan, 2005, p. 97). This freedom to enact changes through public demonstration was a catalyst in the anti-corruption movement in 1973 and 1974 (Chan, 2005, p. 97). Until then, in the history of Hong Kong, public outcry had never been stronger (Chan, 2005, p. 97). Article 19 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states: "Everyone has the right to freedom of opinion and expression; this right includes freedom to hold opinions without interference and to seek, receive and impart information and ideas through any media and regardless of frontiers" (United Nations, 1948). Without the freedom of opinion and expression, and the dissemination of information of the media, the first fight against corruption in Hong Kong may not have occurred.

Once known for its independent media and freedom of the press, Hong Kong has been undergoing a drastic change during the time that this research has unfolded. While Hong Kong has been described in the past as having a vibrant civil society (Centre for Civil Society and Governance, The University of Hong Kong, 2019) (Ngok, 2008), recent upheaval caused by the proposed and subsequently suspended extradition bill has resulted in stifling of the media and press freedoms (Creery, 2019a) (Creery, 2019b). Reporters Without Borders' 2019 World Press Freedom Index ranked Hong Kong 73 out of 180, sandwiched between Tunisia and Northern Cyprus (2019). Since 2009, Hong Kong's press freedoms have been in a slow decline, having dropped 25 in the rankings in ten years (Creery, 2019a). Further, the Hong Kong Journalists Association's most recent annual report described 2019 as "one of the worst years for post-1997 Hong Kong," citing record lows for freedoms of speech, academic research, press, publication and association (Hong Kong Journalists Association, 2019, p. 5).

The current context of Hong Kong's press freedoms is relevant to the discussion on anti-corruption, and the strength of its civil society participation in the current protests. In recent 'Letters to the Editor' of the South China Morning Post, there have been calls for civil society to defend itself against "invasions" in order to "maintain its autonomy and vibrancy" (Lam & Koo, 2019). While the participation and influence of civil society is critical in anti-corruption reform and the anti-corruption agenda, Hong Kong is currently experiencing trying times. In the past, its vibrant population successfully lobbied for massive anti-corruption reforms. Today, its youth is leading the charge in the fight against the extradition bill and police misconduct, while its media is being suppressed (Creery, 2019b). Tomorrow, where will Hong Kong be?

Chapter 5: Introduction to the Youth and Moral Education Office

The youth of any nation is its future. Although Hong Kong is undergoing challenging times, its future lies in its youth population. The ICAC operates under the belief that instilling positive values into young people is a good defense against corruption and temptation (IC2, Appendix B) (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 2). Within the Community Relations Department resides the Youth and Moral Education Office, which was created with the mindset that "integrity building and ethical leadership training should begin with the younger generation" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019). They are tasked with promoting "moral education among young people" and "[enlisting] their support in the fight against corruption", giving a youth-specific spin to the statutory requirement denoted in Section 12 of the ICAC Ordinance (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 3).

In the beginning of the ICAC, responsibility for youth and moral education rested with the Public Education Unit. The 1975 Annual Report outlined how the Public Education Unit would function:

> The work of this unit will include close consultation with the Education Department, local schools, post-secondary colleges, universities, training institutions and curriculum development and examinations authorities. It will engage in activities associated with the development - in curricular and other training programmes at various levels of education – of concepts and schemes to do with changing public attitudes towards corruption, to do with the development of higher standards in respect of personal honesty, ethics, and a sense of community and to do with the restoration of faith in good government. It will attempt to motivate student bodies to take part in the movement against corruption and encourage cooperation between parents and teachers in the education of their young. (Cater, 1975, p. 5.23)

To this day, over forty years later, the areas of focus, "higher standards…of personal honesty, ethics, and a sense of community" (Cater, 1975, p. 5.23), remain the same. The ICAC has remained committed to its close collaboration with the Education Bureau

(formerly Education Department), local schools and institutions, teachers, and parents. It was created with the mindset that "integrity building and ethical leadership training should begin with the younger generation" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 5).

In order to disseminate their message to the youth population, the Youth and Moral Education Office does not employ a "one-way delivery" (IC3, Appendix B) of the anti-corruption and probity message, typical of many talks given on the subject. Instead, the ICAC envisages a collaboration and "[co-creation]" with youth to engage and encourage them to actively participate in the lessons (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 5). The top priority of ICAC's strategy is the "inculcation of positive values" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 5). The use of the word *inculcation* in ICAC's strategy is an interesting one, as the definition refers to "to fix beliefs or ideas in someone's mind, especially by repeating them often" (Cambridge Dictionary, 2019, n.p.). The repetitive focus to instill positive values can be seen from the different levels of youth that the ICAC reaches through varying avenues of media marketing. Rather than specifically focusing on anti-corruption or anti-bribery, the Youth and Moral Education Office targets certain positive values that may lead to behavior in line with its probity message. The four core values defined by the ICAC are honesty, fairness, self-discipline and responsibility (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 7). Supported by the ICAC's internal Media and Communications Department, the teachings of positive moral values are carried over from pre-primary to primary school, from primary school to secondary school, and eventually through the student's tertiary education (IC3, Appendix B). When an individual reaches adulthood, the goal is that the positive values have become internalized at that point, and when faced with an ethical dilemma, the individual chooses the path of probity and integrity.

Before rolling out the educational resources to the broader public, ICAC tests its education kits with a sample of teachers and students to obtain their feedback and to determine whether the lesson plans would be well-received among the broader public. The ICAC then makes changes, if needed (IC3, Appendix B). Educational resources are disseminated to all secondary schools in Hong Kong (IC3, Appendix B); however, there is no obligation on the teacher or school to utilize them during the course of their teaching (IC2 & IC3, Appendix B). The education resources and lesson plans are also made available on the internet (IC3, Appendix B). The ICAC also gives teachers the option to subscribe to an email newsletter that will notify subscribers to new lesson plans and educational kits that are made available on the website.

5.1 Reach of ICAC's programming to secondary and tertiary schools

Each year, ICAC sets targets of: (a) the number of secondary and tertiary schools to reach; and (b) the number of secondary and tertiary students to receive training in corruption prevention and ethics (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 4). The targets are published in Hong Kong's annual budget, which is made available on the government's budget website (GovHK, 2019).

In 2017 and 2018 respectively, 428 and 418 secondary schools were reached (GovHK, 2019, p. 624). Compared to the 506 secondary school institutions within the two school years between 2016-2018 (Education Bureau, 2019), this represents 84.6% of secondary schools reached in 2017, slightly dropping to 82.6% in 2018. The target for 2019 is 400 secondary schools (GovHK, 2019, p. 624), which would represent a 79.1% secondary school reach if fully achieved (Education Bureau, 2019).

For degree awarding universities or vocational schools, or tertiary schools, in 2017 and 2018 respectively, 20 and 21 schools were reached (GovHK, 2019, p. 625). Information on the historical annual number of tertiary schools (including 2017 and 2018) was not publicly found, unlike the same for secondary schools. In 2019, the target for tertiary schools is 21 (GovHK, 2019, p. 625), which represents the full population of tertiary schools in Hong Kong[iv] (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019).

Between 2017 and 2018, the overall number of individual students in secondary in tertiary schools who have received "integrity and ethics training" (GovHK, 2019, p. 625) decreased from 69,209 to 65,289, which represents a 5.7% decrease (GovHK, 2019, p. 625). A footnote to the budget includes an explanation that Hong Kong has been experiencing an overall declining student population, which accounts for the year-to-year decrease in students reached (GovHK, 2019, p. 625). While the total number of students has decreased, the Community Relations Department was able to reach an additional 41,000 secondary and tertiary students in 2017 (GovHK, 2018, p. 612) and 49,800 students in 2018 (GovHK, 2019, p. 625) through "activities organised by ICAC Ambassadors, iTeen Leaders and members of the Youth Chapter" (GovHK, 2019, p. 625). This represents a 21.5% year-on-year increase.

Chapter 6: Kohlberg's Theory of Moral Development

Having defined the core values to disseminate to the population, the ICAC aligns its lesson plans and overall strategy with the Education Bureau's annual curriculum. The curriculum is developed with two key dimensions intertwined – the moral developmental stages of an individual and the annual school curriculum, as prescribed by the Education Bureau (IC3, Appendix B). While the education of morality in schools often takes opposing approaches of a "dogmatic assertion of authority or a relativistic avoidance of issues" (Aron, 1977, p. 214), there remains a need to create a "thoughtful and practical program of moral education" (Aron, 1977, p. 214).

For guidance in creating moral education programs, the Youth and Moral Education Office utilizes Kohlberg's theory of moral development (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 8). Kohlberg's theory categorizes youths' progression of moral development into three levels – pre-conventional, conventional, and post-conventional (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019). The three levels of development are then aligned with the education levels in schools, from pre-primary (or kindergarten), primary, secondary, to finally tertiary education. Education resources, which teach the core values of ICAC, are then developed in line with the theorized capacity of the youth's behavioral development during that particular age (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 8). Kohlberg's original hypothesis suggested moral development was a continuous process throughout one's life (Cherry, 2019), and the ICAC has similarly adopted this continuous learning approach. This can be seen through the various levels of its outreach, spanning from pre-primary school through adulthood.

Kohlberg's theory of moral development was inspired in part by Jean Piaget's theory of moral judgment, which simplified the division of children's development

into before and after ten years of age (Vinney, 2019). Piaget's theory surmised that children under ten viewed rules as fixed, and made moral judgments based on expected consequences (Vinney, 2019) of their actions. Moral judgment of children over ten, on the other hand, were based on intentions (Vinney, 2019). While Piaget's stages of moral development ended there, Kohlberg felt that intellectual development (and therefore moral development) continued past the age of ten (Vinney, 2019). Kohlberg's research consisted of presenting moral dilemmas to groups of youth and subsequently interviewing them to understand their reasoning behind their decisions (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019). As a result, Kohlberg theorized three levels of development, with two stages within each level (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019).

6.1 Criticisms of Kohlberg's method and theory

This research would be remiss if it omitted criticisms of Kohlberg's theory. The purpose of this research is not to prove or disprove whether Kohlberg's theory of moral development is in fact correct in the context of Hong Kong, but rather to highlight the ICAC's use of developmental and behavioral psychology to supplement the creation and delivery of their educational programs. One main critique of Kohlberg's theory is that moral reasoning, and the ability to think through moral dilemmas, does not necessarily suggest decision-making in line with moral behavior (Cherry, 2019). However, the inference is that possessing moral reasoning capabilities may make an individual more predisposed to engaging in moral behavior.

Another critique of Kohlberg's theory maintains the original research was conducted with a biased sample, focusing only on upper-middle class male children, aged 10, 13, and 16 years, in suburban Chicago (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019). Upper-middle class children would inevitably have different moral "value systems and

perspectives" (Cherry, 2019) than children growing up in other socioeconomic environments. However, the sample being comprised of males would also overlook the "female perspective on morality which [tends] to be contextual and derived from an ethics of compassion and concern for other people" (Vinney, 2019). However, thinking of masculine and feminine perspectives and traits in a broader sense, society itself can possess either feminine or masculine qualities (Hofstede Insights, n.d.). Hong Kong's population has been surveyed to possess more masculine qualities of competition and achievement, rather than feminine qualities of compassion and quality of life (Hofstede Insights, n.d.). Noting Hong Kong society's masculine qualities is not to suggest broad application of Kohlberg's theory to the wider Hong Kong population, but simply to challenge whether that criticism is valid in the context of Hong Kong.

Further, as a result of the research being conducted in a Western society, another criticism is that the theory may only apply to Western, more individualistic societies, which would influence the population's moral philosophies (Vinney, 2019). The marked difference between individualistic and collectivist societies can be simplified into whether the top priority is "I versus we" (Bredenoord, 2016, p. 2). While individualistic cultures are independent and focused largely on individual "rights and freedoms" (Vinney, 2019), collectivist cultures, in contrast, place importance on the collective good and harmony of the community or group (Vinney, 2019) (Bredenoord, 2016, p. 2). In a definitive contrast to Kohlberg's study, Hong Kong is considered to be a collectivist society, in which the needs of the group are prioritized over that of the individual (Hofstede Insights, n.d.).

Kohlberg has also been criticized for the moral dilemmas presented to the sample, the most famous of which is now called the Heinz Dilemma (Vinney, 2019). In the scenario presented to the children,

> "a woman has cancer and her doctors believe only one drug might save her. This drug had been discovered by a local pharmacist and he was able to make it for $200 per dose and sell it for $2,000 per dose. The woman's husband, Heinz, could only raise $1,000 to buy the drug. He tried to negotiate with the pharmacist for a lower price or to be extended credit to pay for it over time. But the pharmacist refused to sell it for any less or to accept partial payments. Rebuffed, Heinz instead broke into the pharmacy and stole the drug to save his wife. Kohlberg asked, 'Should the husband have done that?'" (Cherry, 2019, n.p.)

Kohlberg's interest was not necessarily the response to the question, but rather the reasoning and justification behind the response (Cherry, 2019). With the Heinz Dilemma, Kohlberg was criticized for tying the example to the concepts of love and marriage, of which the complexities may not be understood by young boys (Vinney, 2019).

Kohlberg's critics assume that one theory applies to all, but it seems clear that no one theory can apply to an entire population. While Kohlberg's theory was not meant as a blueprint for moral education (Aron, 1977, p. 214), it does serve as a starting point to consider a child's developmental needs and progress to develop an educational strategy.

6.2 ICAC's programs and the application of Kohlberg's Theory

6.2.1 Kohlberg's pre-conventional level and Gee-dor-dor, the flying rabbit

At the earliest stage of moral development, the pre-conventional level, children nine years or younger have not yet internalized their sense of morality (Vinney, 2019). Their sense of morality is influenced by adults and the child's perception of the consequences of breaking rules (Vinney, 2019). In Stage 1, Punishment and Obedience Orientation, the individual believes that rules are fixed and must be obeyed absolutely (Vinney, 2019). One will suffer punishment as a result of disobeying rules;

therefore, children consciously choose to follow the rules (Cherry, 2019). By Stage 2, Individualism and Exchange, the child begins to understand that rules are relative and are in fact not absolute (Vinney, 2019). Different individuals will have different perspectives of the same situation (Vinney, 2019). While Stage 2 offers new insight to the child that rules are not fixed, the underlying cause and effect of following the rules to avoid punishment remains constant at the pre-conventional level.

The ICAC aligns Kohlberg's pre-conventional level of moral development with Hong Kong's pre-primary schools, from age three to six, and (midway through) primary school levels, from age six to age ten (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 8). According to Kohlberg's theory, children at this age tend to do the right thing to avoid punishment (Vinney, 2019). Therefore, ICAC concentrates its educational focus during these years on building a strong foundation of moral values for children, so that punishment can be avoided (IC3, Appendix B). The core values that ICAC focuses on in the pre-conventional levels include fairness, honesty, self-discipline and responsibility (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 9). In this age group, the dissemination of values is mostly achieved through the character and cartoon series of Gee-dor-dor, the flying rabbit (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 12).

The introduction of the Gee-dor-dor cartoon in 1999 (news.gov.hk, 2004) was well received by children and has been a highly successful series for the last twenty years (IC3, Appendix B). In an interview from 2004 with former ICAC Deputy Chief Education Officer Jacky Pang, he explained, "To let [children] understand easily, we have translated the idea into positive values, such as 'honesty', 'fairness', 'abiding by the law', and 'responsibility'. Through games and story-telling, [children] can understand the idea easily," (news.gov.hk, 2004). The animated cartoon series has values-based lessons contained within each episode (ICAC Youth and Moral Education

Office, 2019, p. 12), which are contextualized to experiences that children would recognize and potentially face (news.gov.hk, 2004). In one episode, the concept of bribery is introduced to the audience through a cheerleading competition, where a character bribes the judge with toys and foods, "hoping he will pick her" (news.gov.hk, 2004). While the actual word, bribery, is not introduced into the lessons until adolescent years (IC3, Appendix B), the concept is introduced early through broader themes like "fair competition" and harboring a "clean society" (news.gov.hk, 2004).

While Gee-dor-dor, the ideal hero, generally does the right thing, his friends, especially Piggy Lulu, often do the opposite (IC3, Appendix B). Piggy Lulu is greedy, tells lies, and generally does bad things, which causes trouble for both herself and her friends (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 12). Subsequently, Piggy Lulu and her friends often suffer some kind of punishment as a direct result of her poor behavior (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 12). In line with Kohlberg's first stage, children are able to understand the existence of punishment as a consequence of their bad behavior. In an episode where Piggy Lulu is on an alien planet, she was punished for telling lies in order to gain a bigger prize (ICAC Channel, 2014). Piggy Lulu was created as an example of what not to do, so that children can formulate ideas of her behavior in comparison to that of Gee-dor-dor (IC2, Appendix B). Being more than just cartoon characters, Gee-dor-dor and Piggy Lulu could be influencing children's moral development on a subconscious level. As Faber notes in his research, characters in mass media highlight the marked differences in personalities one can adopt (Faber, 2009, p. 5). The audience is asked 'Do you want to be Gee-dor-dor or Piggy Lulu?'

The ICAC delivers these messages using multi-media packages and electronic books, activity packages, and coloring worksheets, which are created in conjunction with the latest Gee-dor-dor episode (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019,

pp. 11, 12). For example, when Gee-dor-dor and his friends go to outer space, all of the resources have space exploration themes (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, pp. 11, 12). For pre-primary school children, the goal is to make the learning fun, aligning with the Education Bureau's "learning through play" curriculum (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, pp. 11, 12) (IC3, Appendix B). Therefore, the Gee-dor-dor educational kits include props, and ideas for dressing up and role-playing as the Gee-dor-dor characters, and songs to sing about them (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, pp. 11, 12) (IC3, Appendix B). A recent popular activity designed for both pre-primary and primary school children is the interactive 3D coloring worksheet and subsequent rendered animation from the coloring sheet (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, pp. 17, 18), which is described in more detail in Chapter 7, Communication and Media at ICAC. Through these activities, the pre-primary school children are taught basic values and a sense of self and society, which is in conjunction with required curriculum (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 11).

6.2.2 Kohlberg's conventional level and the maintenance of social order

The next level of Kohlberg's moral development is conventional morality, where individuals begin to internalize their sense of morality (Vinney, 2019). According to Kohlberg's theory, most adolescents and adults fall within this level of moral development (Vinney, 2019). Although the individuals internalize their moral standards, they do not necessarily question their morality (Vinney, 2019). The individual focuses on "being 'nice'" (Cherry, 2019) and conforming to social norms and societal expectations of themselves (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019). In Stage 3, Good Interpersonal Relationships, "morality arises from living up to the standards of

a given group, such as one's family or community" (Vinney, 2019). There is an innate need within the individual to be accepted and to be perceived as being a good member of that group (Vinney, 2019). Advancing to Stage 4, Maintaining the Social Order, the individual is aware of the broader rules of society (Vinney, 2019). Therefore, the focus becomes how to maintain social order and obey laws (Vinney, 2019), while also respecting authority and fulfilling one's duty to a prescribed group, i.e. family, community or society (Cherry, 2019). Therefore, between the pre-conventional and conventional levels, there is a marked shift from adhering to rules or a prescribed framework to staying within the broader society's status quo.

Because Kohlberg theorized that conventional morality aligns with the end of primary school and the full duration of secondary school (through age 18), conceptually the need for an adolescent to maintain a societal status quo and ultimately *fit in* makes sense. During these years, ICAC's lessons focus on the "evils of corruption, anti-corruption [legislation, and] ethical decision making" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 9). Emphasizing the evils of corruption and the content of existing legislation reinforces Kohlberg's second level, where the individual is respecting authority and obeying laws, as well as maintaining social order and contributing as a good member of his community (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019). It is during this time, at the age of 14 approximately, when ICAC's lessons introduce the words bribery and corruption (IC3, Appendix B). These are explained within the context of the three ordinances that govern anti-corruption laws in Hong Kong - Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (which governs both the public and the private sector), the Elections (Corrupt and Illegal Conduct) Ordinance (which governs "all conduct concerning an election" (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2017)), and finally, the ICAC Ordinance (which grants ICAC with "law enforcement powers such as investigation, arrest, detention and granting of bail" (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2017)).

At the level of secondary school, ICAC uses "interactive and participatory activities to consolidate positive values" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 9). These would include teaching packages and resources tied to the *ICAC Investigators* television drama series or, if it is an election year, lessons on clean elections tied to the related legislation, the Elections Ordinance (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 20). To tie the teaching packages back to Kohlberg, an example from an *ICAC Investigators* lesson plan would be teachers posing the following question, "Which is more important? To protect individual freedom or maintain social stability and public interest?" (IC3, Appendix B). The question posed around maintenance of social order connects to Kohlberg's conventional level, and offers the students a point of reflection, challenging notions of individualism versus collectivism.

In the past, ICAC officers would also visit secondary schools for face-to-face visits and talks; however, due to time and budget constraints on doing so for all secondary schools, professional drama and acting troupes are hired to stage "interactive drama shows" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 24). Secondary schools will apply for the drama troupes to visit their schools (IC2 & IC3, Appendix B). Through a variety of sponsorships, subsidies from the Education Bureau, and direct support from ICAC (IC2 & IC3, Appendix B), the acting troupes are able to visit approximately 250 schools and reach about 30,000 secondary schools every year (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 24).

Since 2013, secondary school students can also participate in the iTeen Leadership Programme (Independent Commission Against Corruption, n.d.). Approximately 500 student leaders are selected and nominated by teachers (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 22). Those selected participate in leadership trainings and assist teachers in organizing integrity and probity events in

their schools (Independent Commission Against Corruption, n.d.). A community of likeminded teenagers is created, where they can participate in activities ranging from video or singing competitions, building integrity walls, or *ICAC Investigators* television drama viewing and recap sessions (Independent Commission Against Corruption, n.d.). Suggested activities for the teachers and iTeen Leaders are available on the iTeen Leadership website (Independent Commission Against Corruption, n.d.). The iTeen Leadership Programme serves as a community to spread positive values among broader society. Students undertaking these activities also fulfill the Education Bureau's curriculum requirement of Other Learning Experiences ("OLE") for senior secondary students (IC3, Appendix B). Depending on the number of activities held, the participation rate per activity, as well as the required reporting to ICAC on an annual basis, schools and their iTeen Leaders can win recognition awards or even a two-day job shadowing experience at ICAC (IC3, Appendix B).

To tie into the Education Bureau's curriculum requirement of Other Learning Experiences ("OLE"), the ICAC invites secondary schools for a visit to its headquarters. Annually, about 3-4,000 senior secondary students visit the Commission. This comprises an hour and a half visit, with an introduction to the ICAC and Hong Kong's anti-corruption laws (IC3, Appendix B). Enforcement officers also give a tour through the exhibition hall (IC3, Appendix B). The exhibition hall is set up much like a museum, with exhibits and artifacts from big cases in Hong Kong's history, while also showing Hong Kong's transition from its "dark old days" (IC2, Appendix B) to the clean society it is today. The exhibition hall also has exact replicas of interview rooms, for students to sit in, and an area for a police line-up for suspects, equipped with a two-way mirror for observation. The inclusion of the historical context of Hong Kong's corrupt past, as well as the interview room and police line-up room, serve as a point of reflection for students. The students can visualize themselves within the interview room, either being an ICAC officer conducting the interview or the corrupt actor being

interviewed. These reflection points should serve to reinforce the individual's sense of identity and ideally reinforce internalization and a pre-disposition to anti-corruption.

6.2.3 Kohlberg's post-conventional level and individual reflections

The highest level of moral development may not be achieved by everyone. According to Kohlberg, 85-90% of the population will stay at the stages within the conventional level (Vinney, 2019). Hence, only 10-15% of the population is capable of the abstract reasoning required to arrive at post-conventional moral development (Vinney, 2019). Individuals at the post-conventional level begin to question whether what they see around them is necessarily good (Vinney, 2019) and begin contemplating "differing values, opinions, and beliefs of other people" (Cherry, 2019).

In Stage 5, Social Contract and Individual Rights, the individual believes that his goal is to foster improvement in society at large (Vinney, 2019) as a result of an unwritten, unspoken social contract. The individual believes that, while laws may exist for the greater good (McLeod, 2013), they may also work against specific individuals or a group of people (McLeod, 2013). Issues are not always so clear that they have black or white answers. In the Heinz Dilemma, with the question of whether the protection of his wife's life outweighs the crime of stealing the drug, an individual in Stage 5 of moral development would respond that, of course, life was more important than the crime of theft (McLeod, 2013). Conversely, in a simplified version, an individual in Stage 4 society (McLeod, 2013) would place the emphasis on obeying laws which prohibit stealing.

By the final stage, Stage 6, Universal Principles, individuals have developed their own principles of morality, regardless of whether they are in conflict with law or

authority (McLeod, 2013) (Vinney, 2019). Some examples of universally applied moral principles would be equality, justice, and human rights (McLeod, 2013), which those at Stage 6 believe should apply to everyone (McLeod, 2013) (Vinney, 2019). Individuals at this stage would defend these moral principles, even if they suffer consequences of imprisonment or disapproval from society or peers (McLeod, 2013).

While Kohlberg was more skeptical that the majority would actually reach the post-conventional level, ICAC's education makes the assumption that students have reached this level of development by post-secondary (or vocational) school and tertiary (university-level) schools (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 25). Mostly, ICAC officers reach these students by conducting talks on personal ethics and corruption prevention to tertiary students (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 25). However, in addition the ICAC has developed a Personal Ethics Module for integration into the tertiary school curriculum (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 26). Within the Personal Ethics Module, students learn more details about anti-corruption legislation, and also students meet Elaine, a fictional student who is often faced with ethical dilemmas (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, pp. 26, 27). While Elaine may not experience corruption or bribery directly, she encounters school-related ethical dilemmas, including plagiarism, forging attendance sheets for friends, and manipulating survey data for school research projects (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 27). Students are able to reflect on how they would approach similar situations, and how their values-based education would guide them to respond in kind when faced with these situations. The reflection-based curriculum[v] feeds back into Kohlberg's post-conventional level of development, where issues that individuals face are not so clear-cut. A strong foundation of moral values should serve as a guide to them when encountering some ethical dilemmas.

Tertiary school students also have the opportunity to apply to be an ICAC Ambassador. The ICAC Ambassador Programme began in 2007 and now has expanded to almost all tertiary institutions, with approximately ten ambassadors per school (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 28). Unlike the iTeen Leadership Programme, where secondary school students execute the plans of their teachers, ICAC Ambassadors have a certain autonomy in the programming and activities for their school (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 28) (IC2, Appendix B). With advice or assistance provided by an ICAC officer as a mentor, ambassadors are able to develop leadership skills by organizing on-campus activities to promote anti-corruption and values (Ngu, et al., 2019) (IC2, Appendix B). Activities range from craft or games booths to cafes, and use social media to spread news of events and messages of probity (Ngu, et al., 2019) (IC2, Appendix B).

6.3 The connection between corruption prevention systems, moral development and theories of corruption

While the ICAC has embraced a moral and values-based education for its youth, its application of Kohlberg's theory of moral development appears to have more depth than simply the alignment between its educational programs and an individual's moral development. When thinking back to the corruption prevention systems that anti-corruption agencies have in place, and considering values-based versus compliance-based approaches, one has to look at the underlying connection between the two. They are not entirely mutually exclusive of each other, especially at the moment of decision-making. Both compliance-based and values-based systems appear to be intertwined with the different stages of moral development in Kohlberg's theory and

the means by which the Youth and Moral Education Office fosters the growth of the individual's moral development through its education programs.

Compliance-based corruption prevention systems rely on a legal framework, "so well constructed and so effectively implemented" (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 4) to detect and enforce punishment on any breaches. In a perfect world of compliance systems, no one would breach the law because the threat of being caught and suffering punishments would outweigh the cost of undertaking the corrupt act (Scott & Gong, 2019, p. 4). From an economic perspective, public choice theory may hold the answers to why an individual chooses to breach the law and behave corruptly, which looks to the maximization of an individual's utility (de Graaf, 2007, p. 46). Originally developed to look at the behavior of elected politicians, public choice theorists argued that the elected individual will seek out ways to maximize his welfare (Mbaku, 2008, p. 430). Individuals will remain "egoistic, rational, and utility maximizers" (Mbaku, 2008, p. 430) and continue to maximize self-interest, unless they are constitutionally constrained from engaging in or undertaking "opportunistic activities" such as rent seeking or corruption (Mbaku, 2008, p. 43). Although the individual may want to maximize his utility, either based on Susan Rose-Ackerman's rational cost-benefit analysis (de Graaf, 2007, p. 47), or on Klitgaard's equation (de Graaf, 2007, p. 47), in a perfect world the constraint of a legal or legislative framework prevents corrupt behavior from manifesting. While it can be argued that public choice theory perhaps does not apply to children and their choices, it may be suggested that children and adults alike often make the choice to maximize their utility.

Kohlberg's theory (at the pre-conventional level) and public choice theory both argue that rules act as a constraint to that maximization of utility. An adherence to, and constraint by, the law shares commonalities with Kohlberg's pre-conventional level of moral development, where individuals within the first stage follow rules in

order to avoid punishment (Vinney, 2019). The avoidance or threat of punishment is the underlying motivating factor for this conformity, regardless of whether the individual perceives rules as absolute or relative, which are characterized by the first and second stages, respectively (Vinney, 2019). While Kohlberg's pre-conventional level draws a causal relationship between avoidance of punishment and adherence to the rules, it stops short of trying to answer the underlying question of motive. Why is it important to the individual to avoid punishment and follow the rules?

In trying to answer that question, the ICAC seeks a values-based solution that is more individually internalized, rather than falling back on an external prevention mechanism. From a behavioral perspective, when children are at the pre-conventional level of moral development, the Youth and Moral Education Office begins to influence the formulation of positive values within the child. Not only should a child follow the rules to avoid punishment, their internal motivation for doing so should be because it is the *right thing to do*. This ideal aligns with ICAC's core values of "virtues of honesty, fairness, responsibility, [and] self-discipline" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 9), which are introduced and disseminated to the public through its pre-primary school education programs. Children at the pre-conventional level only begin to understand the importance of following the rules. The consequence of not following the rules is receiving punishment. In the educational programs, these messages are consistently reinforced in conjunction with positive values and the ideal of *doing the right thing* (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 9).

As an example of their inculcation of positive values, many of the Gee-dor-dor episodes (ICAC's proprietary cartoon mascot) tell the story of Piggy Lulu trying to cheat the system by not following the rules, and as a result, suffering some kind of punishment for those missteps (ICACChannel, 2014) (IC2, Appendix B). The moral

learning of the episodes falls back on the reinforcement of the values of integrity, honesty, fairness and responsibility, among others (ICACChannel, 2014) (IC2, Appendix B). While ICAC's pre-primary education programs would be considered part of a values-based prevention system, there is the connection with the compliance-based prevention system which is grounded in rules and adherence to those rules as a deterrent to bad behavior.

Compliance-based prevention systems not only suggest compliance with rules and legal frameworks, but this research contends that in an individual's mind, similar conclusions could be drawn for compliance with social order. Maintaining social order has roots in the maintenance of some kind of status quo, whether it be in law or natural order. The underlying theme in Kohlberg's conventional level is the maintenance of social order, where the individual's sense of morality is aligned with that of his family, friends, or community at large (Vinney, 2019). This draws similar connections with social learning theory, where individuals are more likely to engage in certain behaviors if they observe such behavior around them (Bandura, 1971, p. 2), and if they feel such behavior has been approved and is widespread among their social circle (Tavits, 2010). This reinforcement of the individual's behavior by society can suggest the individual wanting both to live up to the moral standards of one's social circle and an underlying concern with maintaining some semblance of cohesion in the social framework. Kohlberg's conventional level also maintains that individuals' behaviors at this level also abide by the rules, arising from an obligation to fulfill one's duty to society and one's respect for authority (Cherry, 2019) (Vinney, 2019).

Within the iTeen Leadership Programme and ICAC Ambassador Programme, the underlying community which is created not only provides youth with leadership training and opportunities within their schools and communities, but also creates a community around youth that focuses on probity and integrity. Such a community

helps to reinforce Kohlberg's conventional level idea that individuals would want to stay within the status quo of their peer group or community, in compliance with the societal norms set forth by their peers. ICAC's development of these communities would seem to suggest an application of social learning theory, where an individual's behavior is influenced by the approval of their peers (Tavits, 2010, p. 1260). If their peers behave with high moral integrity and values, this will in turn reinforce their behavior to comply and stay within the status quo. If, through social learning theory, people who are surrounded by good people in turn do good things, according to Punch's organizational misbehavior theories, the inverse appears to be true - a deviant group is able to demand conformity to a group which will influence an individual to behave corruptly. Punch, through his investigation of police corruption, places the responsibility on the organization, not the individual, for creating a culture of corruption (Punch, 2009, p. 239). If the onus is placed on the organization, then the ICAC bears responsibilities in ushering these community groups into the light by spreading and reinforcing messages of integrity and probity.

The concepts of respect for authority, playing one's part in maintaining social order, and one's obligation to family, community, or society, are supported by the media campaigns and characters the ICAC produces. The messages are gently woven into ICAC's education curricula and reach the youth audience either through a direct method, for example, through iSir's YouTube videos, or in a more indirect, reflective manner, with the *ICAC Investigators* series on primetime television. iSir, a fictional character described more in Chapter 7, addresses specifics of anti-corruption legislation, i.e. the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance and the Elections (Corrupt and Illegal Conduct) Ordinance through his various social media channels and provides a model of integrity to his audience (IC4, Appendix B). It could even be argued that iSir represents an idealized role model for youth to emulate his behavior. The values-based message of probity that iSir disseminates is given against a backdrop of the

legislation and regulation of a compliance-based system. While iSir sends a more direct message, *ICAC Investigators* is a more thought-provoking approach into the individual's psyche. Each episode of the series is based on an actual case investigated by ICAC's Operations Department (IC4, Appendix B). The audience is able to see the internal struggle of the protagonist as he faces an ethical dilemma and chooses a corrupt path, usually to the detriment and disappointment of his family (Donald, 2013). The use of a television series also connects with social learning theory, which will be discussed in Chapter 7.1.2, *Analysis of ICAC Investigators*. Within the series, there is the compliance-based system, supported by the ICAC agents who rigorously enforce the law, and also a very evident values-based approach. The core values of ICAC, honesty, fairness, responsibility, and self-discipline (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 7), are highlighted in the struggles of the main character of each episode. While both iSir and the complex nuances of *ICAC Investigators* will be described in the Communication and Media chapter, it is worth noting another example of the integration between compliance and values-based corruption prevention approaches.

As individuals reach adulthood, according to Kohlberg, some will progress to the post-conventional level but most will stay at the conventional level (Vinney, 2019). For those at the post-conventional level, although they may not be morally bound to absolutely obey laws in society, professionally they may be. Most professional organizations possess a code of conduct for employees to adhere to and, in turn, there are punishments for breaches of this code. There is likely to be no justification for breaching organizational codes of conduct in universal ethical principles. Presumably, since most people stay at the conventional levels, their drivers remain at the level where they respect authority (their employer) and maintain the status quo (compliance) (Vinney, 2019).

When moving into the post-conventional level of moral development, if people reach this level, they transcend traditional rules and laws to adopt more universal moral principles. Put another way, in decision-making, their moral compass points towards the greater good of society (Vinney, 2019). While there is no single theory of the cause of corruption that can be tied to this post-conventional sentiment of acting for the greater good, the act in itself could be an apex of the anti-corruption ideal (Ochulor & Bassey, 2010). As Ochulor and Bassey describe, "Since corruption works against the common good, any act of corruption is a war against society and consequently a war against man and the metaphysical fabric of his existence" (Ochulor & Bassey, 2010, p. 470). This research tends to agree that corruption is both against the common good and a "war" against the "metaphysical fabric of his existence" (Ochulor & Bassey, 2010, p. 470), or in layman's terms, his identity. The struggle between an individual's identity and decisions to engage in corrupt behavior is likely to be minimized through the inculcation of moral education throughout the years of a Hong Kong adult's lifetime. As described by Scott and Gong, values-based corruption prevention approaches assume that violating values and social norms of honesty and integrity is a "moral impossibility" (2019, p. 4) for the individual and therefore no corruption offenses would be committed.

Chapter 7: Communication and Media at ICAC

The ICAC's Community Relations Department is supported by a Communications Department, which comprises the Mass Media Group, New Media Group and the Design Unit. The ICAC defines mass media as television and radio programs, as well as advertising campaigns. Their New Media Group includes any and all internet-related campaigns. The Design Unit does graphic design work in-house, in conjunction with external designers when needed (IC4, Appendix B).

Aside from design work, the ICAC also outsources much of their new media campaigns, recognizing that they may not have the internal resources and capabilities to spread the intended message to their target audiences. IC4, an officer in the communications department, stated during the interview, "Youth nowadays is different from what we learned" (IC4, Appendix B), therefore the focus has to be new media. Through Facebook, Instagram, YouTube, and Weibo (for the mainland China market), the ICAC creates videos, posts, and comics to reach today's Hong Kong youth. Knowing the challenges of social media platforms, the ICAC engages social media partners to keep up with regular posting and engagement.

Not only are there challenges with youth engagement, but also that of ICAC management perception of the products their partners are producing. IC4 had noted a situation where a new comic character was developed for the market, but management generally did not like the comic and deemed the characters drawn in too ugly a style (IC4, Appendix B). However, it was not a disagreement that directly challenged the outsourced partner or even prevented the comic from coming to fruition and subsequently to market (IC4, Appendix B). Management at ICAC were able to recognize the dichotomy between their opinion and that of their target market, and the comic was introduced with positive feedback (IC4, Appendix B). This

recognition and acknowledgment that management does not know the youth market is both realistic, humbling, and commendable.

Recognition of the trend of social media is also a strength of ICAC. As stated by a Senior Community Relations Officer for ICAC, "The rapid technological advancement, and the rise of new and social media, have brought unprecedented changes to the pattern of people's behaviour in the reception of information in modern society" (Leung, 2017). The ICAC recognized that, in order to deliver their message to the public, they needed a different messenger other than themselves. Therefore, ICAC, in conjunction with their design partners, have developed proprietary characters to bring their ideas and values out to the youth market. They have very unique personalities and different perspectives.

One of the oldest and most popular characters is Gee-dor-dor, a flying rabbit, designed for pre-primary and school students (ages 3-11). Gee-dor-dor recently had an interactive new media campaign, in which "Interactive 3D Colouring Worksheets" (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, pp. 17, 18) were distributed among schools. In a recent cartoon episode, Gee-dor-dor and his friends went into outer space, so the coloring worksheet with the main characters in space was distributed to schools. After the children color the worksheet, the parent takes a photo of the coloring sheet, and an animation would subsequently be rendered from the child's drawing. The animation shows Gee-dor-dor with the spaceship, and other items in the child's color palette, being incorporated into a new space adventure. IC3, an ICAC officer in the Youth and Media Office, said she has children in primary school, and in her experience the children enjoy watching and seeing something they created come to fruition (IC3, Appendix B).

Another character, iSir, is a virtual spokesperson, and was designed to deliver the "latest news and initiatives of the Commission in a light-hearted manner" (Leung,

2017, p. 155). iSir, or Isaac, is always smartly dressed in a suit and tie. In the iTeen Camp version, Isaac enjoys reading detective novels and dreams of becoming an ICAC investigator, like his father and grandfather (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019c). There is another version of iSir, a YouTube animation, where Isaac has already reached adulthood, and is more serious (govHK, n.d.). iSir educates the audience on the anti-corruption and anti-bribery laws of Hong Kong and highlights living and acting with integrity (govHK, n.d.). ICAC utilizes iSir to deliver their ideas and messages of integrity to the audience (IC4, Appendix B).

The Greedy Kin sloth is a new character designed for secondary students, and is primarily promoted on his own Instagram page. While iSir is a direct and proper character, Greedy Kin is the opposite, characterized as an ironic "negative icon" (IC4, Appendix B). Greedy Kin is known for his sarcasm and is prone to telling lies and making mistakes (IC4, Appendix B). The irony of Greedy Kin is used to stimulate the minds of, and promote inner reflection in, the secondary students (IC4, Appendix B). The ICAC often interviews people on the streets of Hong Kong for videos to be featured on the Greedy Kin Instagram. The respondents are aware that the interviews are being conducted for ICAC's Greedy Kin account. In the past, interviewers have asked respondents what superpower they would like and whether or not they lie. These will typically tie into the characteristics and values Hong Kong citizens find important to life, which are in alignment with the core values that ICAC promotes. The ICAC considers the Greedy Kin character and Instagram account to have been a successful means of reaching secondary students (IC4, Appendix B), and as of 10 August 2019, there were 5,719 followers on the Greedy Kin Instagram account (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019a).

Another way ICAC reaches the youth is through partnerships with local celebrities. These include key opinion leaders, also known as social media influencers,

YouTube celebrities, local athletes, or local singers (IC4, Appendix B). A popular key opinion leader or YouTube celebrity would be hired to interview a local celebrity, and often gives messages or discusses themes of working hard, doing one's best, and chasing your dreams (IC4, Appendix B). This ties into the value system that ICAC reinforces among the public. The videos hosted by the local celebrities have an average viewership of 150,000 views (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019b).

The ICAC is also in the forefront of utilizing new technologies to engage their target audience. At various events and festivals, ICAC now has Virtual Reality ("VR") or Augmented Reality ("AR") booths, where people can be transported into a different world. In an example IC4 shared, a long wooden beam was included in the physical world, to feign a building ledge in the virtual world (IC4, Appendix B). When the individual would put on the VR/AR goggles, he would be transported directly into a real ICAC case (IC4, Appendix B). The objective of the game was to find evidence and clues along the building ledge to solve the case, all without falling off the building (IC4, Appendix B). However, the future and efficacy of educational VR and AR is still debated (Goldchain, 2019). At this year's U.S. Department of Education's ED Games Expo, Michael Nesterak, a professional in the interactive media industry, was quoted as saying, "This [VR and AR] was never designed to be necessarily an end product. It's basically us doing the first phase of discovery," (Goldchain, 2019). That is exactly how ICAC treats the VR and AR games; in itself, it is not an educational tool, but it forms part of a discovery process for youth to learn about ICAC's cases and garner an interest in what ICAC does (IC4, Appendix B).

7.1 Media and moral identity

While the Communications Department is behind the means of dissemination of the ICAC's message, there appears to be a deeper contextual meaning than simply the values it highlights. There is existing research that shows a connection between what people see on television and how it affects not only their identity but also their decision-making capabilities. This research draws upon those theories and applies them in the context of the ICAC's two most popular television programs, Gee-dor-dor and *ICAC Investigators.* However, this current research is limited in scope and purpose and will not empirically test whether these two shows do in fact influence a Hong Kong citizen's sense of identity and ethical-decision making.

7.1.1 Gee-dor-dor and the formulation of the sense of self

For a young child, building his own identity is an automatic, yet dynamic process (Faber, 2009, p. 77). The process that a child undergoes to build his personality is active and constantly changing to the stimulus around him (Faber, 2009, p. 77). While children's personalities are shaped by those close to them, Faber suggests that children develop close relationships with their favorite television show (Faber, 2009). Children gain inspiration from people or personalities that they admire, which would include those they follow on television (Faber, 2009, p. 77).

Gee-dor-dor, the main cartoon character of the children's series, has been compared to *Superman* in the values that he holds to be important and the moral high

ground he takes (news.gov.hk, 2004). Such a comparison is interesting to note, when viewed in the context of media portrayal of the different typologies of individuals. As Faber describes,

> "As children, the identification process begins when a child begins to understand some of the elements of personality – general typologies of individuals both real and fictional – and then gradually shapes them into more realistic images of themselves and understandings of others as he or she grows older." (2009, p. 4)

Therefore, it could be inferred that the morality of *Superman* or Gee-dor-dor and the ethical decisions both make during the course of their adventures could be shaping the broader personality of the child who is absorbed in the storyline or character. Through one's identification with the character of Gee-dor-dor, the discrepancy between the child's concept of his actual self and his ideal self (as portrayed by Gee-dor-dor) narrows, regardless of whether a comparison with the ideal triggers a recognition of the individual's own shortcomings (Faber, 2009, p. 4). The awareness of the child's self, versus the idealized version, helps to keep the child "cognitively grounded in reality" (Faber, 2009, pp. 4-5). Giving a child a strong moral character to look up to could influence his emulation of that personality and desire to be similar to the ideal self, seen in *Superman* or Gee-dor-dor. The child could be in the beginning stages of formulating his own identity, or the identity of his ideal self.

7.1.2 Analysis of ICAC Investigators

The most successful way ICAC reaches the population, and arguably the most popular method, is through its television drama series, *ICAC Investigators*. The television series is co-produced by ICAC and Television Broadcasts Ltd, Hong Kong's main television provider, and broadcast once every two to three years (IC4, Appendix B)

(Donald, 2013, p. 80) (GovHK, 2019). Each episode is a dramatized version of an actual case that ICAC has investigated and completed (IC4, Appendix B) (Donald, 2013, p. 80). Filmed in Cantonese, the series is also available dubbed in Mandarin Chinese and with English subtitles (Donald, 2013, p. 80). By making multilingual options available, the series has a potential to reach its Cantonese, English, and Mandarin-speaking citizens, which comprise 95.1% of Hong Kong's population (World Population Review, 2019). In 2019, when *ICAC Investigators* launched its most recent series, its viewership reached 7.2 million people in Hong Kong (IC4, Appendix B). Prior to the 2019 season, when the last series aired in 2016, total viewership reached 9.65 million (GovHK, 2017). As described by David C. Donald, Professor of Law at Chinese University of Hong Kong,

> "The series … does for Hong Kong's ICAC and its struggle against corruption much of the same work that the James Bond films and Mission Impossible performed for the Cold War, or Fox Television's 24 performed for the post-9/11 fight against terrorism." (2013, p. 80)

ICAC is able to reach a wide audience of young adults and adults through this modern and unique pedagogy (Donald, 2013, p. 80).

Analysis of *ICAC Investigators* is in fact fascinating and multifaceted, despite simply being a television drama. The demographic of *ICAC Investigators'* target audience is the general population of Hong Kong, not directed at any specific age group (IC4, Appendix B). Considering that, according to Kohlberg, most people are at the conventional level of moral development, their moral decisions would be based on a sense of group or community and maintenance of social order. These themes play heavily into the choices made by the protagonists of each episode.

At the most basic level, *ICAC Investigators* appeals to the individual's sense of community by bringing localization and the context of Hong Kong's own corruption cases to the viewer. Being based on actual cases, it provides a sense of familiarity,

and connections between the viewer, the series, and the city of Hong Kong (Donald, 2013, p. 80). The viewer may have heard of the case when it was uncovered or prosecuted, or perhaps the case took place in their neighborhood. By localizing the context of the series, a connection between the individual's sense of self and his belonging with the community could be generated (Lewis, 2011). Given the vast globalized and digital era in which young adults live, localization of the series helps facilitate a deeper sense of community with the viewer (Lewis, 2011), in solidarity with the city and the ICAC. Applying Kohlberg's theory, with localization the individual not only reaches Stage 3, Good Interpersonal Relationships, where one's morality is reinforced by the standards of community, but surpasses Stage 3 to bring the individual into Stage 4, Maintaining Social Order (Vinney, 2019). The series and its portrayal of ICAC and its officers reinforces the maintenance of social order, his duty to his community, and the respect that individuals should show towards authority (Vinney, 2019).

The cases presented in the episodes encompass both public and private corruption (Donald, 2013, p. 80). The main protagonists are confronted by a moral dilemma and eventually succumb to corruption (Donald, 2013, pp. 80-81). Eventually, the protagonist is invited for coffee at ICAC headquarters, questioned, and oftentimes incarcerated shortly thereafter (Donald, 2013, p. 81). But more critically,

> "The filming focuses on the pivotal decision, the point at which the suspect chooses either to fulfil public duty or to serve private interest. Each episode of the series brings viewers' vicarious participation in this fateful decision, including the hollow pleasure of ill-gotten gain and the painful regret that inevitably follows." (Donald, 2013, p. 81)

The viewer is taken through the moral dilemma of the main protagonist and the aftermath resulting from the decisions undertaken following that dilemma (Donald, 2013).

The psychosocial development that occurs in adolescents and young adults begins to be directly influenced and defined by the various types of mass media with which they come into contact (Faber, 2009, p. 80). The influence of media is used to explore "their possible roles in adult society" (Faber, 2009, p. 82). There is an identification that occurs with the portrayed archetypes of the fictional characters themselves. Hearkening to Carl Jung's archetype theory, Jung believed that these archetypes were "common to all people, and that the unconscious recognition of any such image in a person's daily life would lead to a numinous or powerful emotional recognition" (Faber, 2009, p. 8). In the case of *ICAC Investigators*, this emotional recognition is intended to be the recognition of one's self, in the shoes of either the protagonist, who reached a moral dilemma crossroads and was tempted into corrupt behavior, or that of the righteous ICAC.

The symbolism behind the portrayal of both the ICAC officers and those involved in corrupt activities would also have a subconscious effect on the viewer's perception of these individuals and the characters and personalities they portray (Faber, 2009, p. 82). In the show, individuals involved in corrupt or shady dealings are portrayed in low light, often smoking cigarettes or drinking alcohol (Donald, 2013, p. 84). The leaders of the criminal activities are driven by greed and tend to rule through fear and intimidation (Donald, 2013, p. 83). It inevitably proves to be a mistake for the protagonist to associate with corrupt actors and succumb to their corrupt behavior (Donald, 2013).

Conversely, the ICAC is portrayed as a virtuous organization with officers capable of understanding the moral plight of the protagonist and sympathizing with them (Donald, 2013, p. 83). Contrasting with the dimly-lit portrayal of the corrupt actors, ICAC officers are seen in brightly-lit offices or publicly in broad daylight, drinking only water, tea, or coffee (Donald, 2013, p. 83).

> "When the ICAC swings its investigation into motion, it is made very evident … that we are being shown a force that must be respected: they are cool and efficient, and even appear omniscient and omnipresent as they photograph every suspect at every incriminating moment, an all-seeing eye from which one cannot hide." (Donald, 2013, pp. 82-83)

Donald continues by suggesting that this portrayal of the ICAC may "have an impact on the average viewer's estimation of the risk connected with corrupt behavior" (2013, p. 83). By making an obvious dichotomy between ICAC and the corrupt actors in the series, both through visual elements and the actions of the characters themselves, it serves to reduce "discrepancy between people's actual and ideal selves" (Faber, 2009, pp. 4-5). The obvious dichotomy also keeps "[the individual] grounded in reality" (Faber, 2009, pp. 4-5). As with the example of Gee-dor-dor, individuals will often use this as a basis to try to narrow the field between their actual self and their ideal self (Faber, 2009).

It does not come as a surprise that much of what comprises our "identities and world views come from popular culture" (Faber, 2009, p. 39). What is truly unique is an anti-corruption commission's use of popular culture and media, interwoven with its education resources, to help shape an individual's sense of self and identity. As Faber suggests, "healthy development is guided in part by whether the person thoughtfully identifies with a media figure… or simply idealizes them" (Faber, 2009, p. 4). Whether an individual "thoughtfully identifies with a media figure" (Faber, 2009, p. 4) implies a certain level of reflection that the individual should achieve in identifying with a fictional character. With *ICAC Investigators*, a platform for self-reflection has been created for the viewer.

In addition to points of self-reflection on an individual's identity, *ICAC Investigators* also provides the viewer with a "learning phenomenon" (Bandura, 1971, p. 2), resulting from the observation of other people's behavior and the consequences suffered as a result of their behavior (Bandura, 1971, p. 2). This coincides with the

central hypotheses suggested by social learning theory, in which behavior is learned or supported through societal approval of such behavior. The consequences suffered by characters on the show typically are arrest, incarceration, as well as the emotional betrayal felt by their family members (Donald, 2013). While one could argue that the punishments or consequences suffered by a television character would have little impact on the viewer, Bandura disagreed. He noted that emotional responses could be developed vicariously through observing or "witnessing the affective reactions of others undergoing painful or pleasurable experiences" (Bandura, 1971, p. 2). The viewer need not go through his own process of trial and error for corrupt behavior; he can assume the outcome will be similar to the ones suffered by the people he has observed (Bandura, 1971, p. 2). The act of simply "seeing others punished for their actions" (Bandura, 1971, p. 2) has the ability to inhibit that behavior in the observer (Bandura, 1971, p. 2). Seeing the consequences of behavior not only elicits emotional responses from the viewer, but also, Bandura notes, can influence the observer's (or viewer's) action or behavior.

Although *ICAC Investigators* is simply a television series produced by ICAC, it is a multi-faceted, thoughtful approach to shaping the moral identity of its viewers. The target demographic for *ICAC Investigators* also coincides with the portion of the population which should be within the conventional and post-conventional levels of Kohlberg's moral development. The soft influences of the television series offer the viewer personal reflections of corrupt life in Hong Kong, and possibly solidify their values-based moral identity.

Chapter 8: Conclusions

Hong Kong is a leader in the anti-corruption realm, and notably the work of ICAC's Community Relations Departments garners attention of researchers and anti-corruption agencies alike. Its Youth and Moral Education Office and the breadth of their youth educational programs have not yet received the widespread recognition or credit that they should.

At the foundation of its education programs lie the values-based teachings the ICAC weaves into school curricula. From an early age, Hong Kong children are taught the core values of ICAC - honesty, fairness, self-discipline and responsibility (ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019, p. 7). Utilizing concepts from Kohlberg's pre-conventional levels, lesson plans, activities and cartoon series are used to disseminate moral lessons. Young children would learn that following rules not only leads to avoidance of punishment but also may lead to maximizing their utility. These lessons draw support from public choice theory, suggesting that unless there are constraints or rules to prevent them from doing so, an individual will always choose to maximize their utility. The Gee-dor-dor cartoons targeted toward young children introduce similar themes surrounding rules, punishment, and rewards (utility) in their episodes, while subconsciously beginning to shape a child's moral identity. By giving young audiences a hero or an ideal self, in the form of Gee-dor-dor, to emulate, the gap between their ideal self and actual self begins to narrow. The desire to be like their ideal self guides, changes and shapes their behavior in a positive light.

As children age, the maintenance of social order and authorities, as well as the need for social acceptance, drive their decisions. During this time, adolescents are taught about the anti-corruption legal framework in Hong Kong, and begin to

build communities around integrity and probity, through iTeen Leadership and ICAC Ambassador Programmes in school. Building an ethical community to rally around suggests the positive application of social learning theory, where an individual's behavior is influenced by the approval of their peers, and Kohlberg's conventional level, where the individual is concerned with conforming and maintaining the status quo. However, those who disagree with organizational theories of misbehavior state that culture is responsible for shaping behavior, but the creation and fostering of integrity-based community groups also accords with their ideas.

A strong way that the ICAC supplements its teachings to the Hong Kong population is the popular television series, *ICAC Investigators*. Schools have integrated lesson plans with clips from the show, in which actual cases undertaken by the ICAC unfold in front of the audience. The show provides a localized context to the problem of corruption and, by doing so, creates a deeper connection with the viewers and their community. On a deeper level, the show gives young adults an avenue to reflect on their identities and their roles "in adult society" (Faber, 2009, p. 82). The self-reflection encouraged by the series often challenges the viewers to assess whether they are fulfilling their roles as the ideal selves that they strive to be. Viewers can also learn by living vicariously through the characters on the show. As Bandura termed it, the learning phenomenon that follows can influence the viewer's actions or behaviors, which accords with social learning theory.

The ICAC's values-based education cannot be specifically emulated in order to create societies intolerant of corruption. As discussed previously, certain preconditions need to be in place before public trust in an institution can become widespread. Because of the ICAC's previous work, Hong Kong already enjoys the chance to thrive within a moral climate that is outwardly supported by the political will of the government. Furthermore, a very significant budget is required to

maintain such a moral climate with robust, lifelong campaigns and the continued innovations required to address the changing needs of the population. However, the large financial commitment required to develop and sustain such programs is a small price to pay.

The youth are our future. Throughout a Hong Kong citizen's life, they have been brought up in the values-based education system that ICAC supports. From childhood through adulthood, he is given strong role models to reflect on and emulate, and is encouraged to ask: "What kind of person do I want to be?" By utilizing theories of moral development, the ICAC shapes and guides an individual as his behavior and moral identity begins to develop. Theories on the causes of corruption are intertwined, both in the IACA-developed education curricula, as well as within the communities the ICAC supports. Through the use of both traditional and social media, the ICAC also creates various points of self-reflection for the individual throughout his life. Both inside and outside the classroom, young people learn about anti-corruption and integrity through lessons on *doing the right thing.*

While the ICAC's youth-directed anti-corruption programs are not the only reason Hong Kong has been successful in its fight against corruption, they are a significant factor in the long-term sustainable success of its anti-corruption agenda. The youth are the future. The strength of their character and moral identity will shape the world that they inherit.

Appendix A – Written Consent from ICAC

As stated in an email from IC1, a Senior Officer in the Community Relations Department, dated 5 August 2019:

> Your request for ICAC officers and Ambassadors signing individual consent form[vi] refers.
>
> We considered that the ICAC officers will be sharing our work in our official capacity rather than on an individual basis. This is the same for the students who will attend your interviews in the capacity of ICAC Ambassadors. So, instead of signing the consent form individually, I would like to state here in one go that we do not consent to the use of the name or title of ICAC staff and ICAC Ambassadors who shall remain anonymous within the contents of the research paper.
>
> Please find enclosed the visit programme with the number of ICAC officers and Ambassadors for your information. See you tomorrow.
>
> Best Regards
>
> IC1 | Senior xxx Officer | Administration Branch | Independent Commission Against Corruption | Hong Kong, China

Appendix B – Interview List

IC1, Senior Officer in the Community Relations Department of the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Sharing on the work of ICAC and Community Relations Department*. Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 6 August 2019.

IC2, Senior Officer in the Youth & Moral Education Office of the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Sharing on anti-corruption campaigns and strategies for youth.* Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 6 August 2019.

IC3, Senior Officer (2) in the Youth & Moral Education Office of the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Sharing on anti-corruption campaigns and strategies for youth.* Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 6 August 2019.

IC4, Senior Officer Mass Communication Office of the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Sharing on the use of social and new media.* Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 6 August 2019.

IC5, Youth & Education Officer of the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Focus group meeting with ICAC Ambassadors*. Focus group discussion. Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 7 August 2019.

IAB1, Youth Ambassador representing X University[vii] and the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Focus group meeting with ICAC Ambassadors*. Focus group discussion. Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 7 August 2019.

IAB2, Youth Ambassador representing X University[viii] and the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Focus group meeting with ICAC Ambassadors*. Focus group discussion. Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 7 August 2019.

IAB3, Youth Ambassador representing Y University[ix] and the Independent Commission Against Corruption. *Focus group meeting with ICAC Ambassadors*. Focus group discussion. Interviewed by Lannie Su. Interviewed at the ICAC Headquarters, in Hong Kong. 7 August 2019.

Appendix C – Agenda for Interviews

Study Visit to the ICAC by Ms Lannie Su, CFE

2017-2019 Master in Anti-Corruption Studies, IACA

6 August 2019 (Tuesday), 1400 – 1730hrs – 4 attendees from ICAC

- Sharing on the work of ICAC and Community Relations Department
  Senior International Liaison and Training Officer
  International Liaison and Training Group

- Sharing on anti-corruption campaigns and strategies for youth
  Senior Youth & Education Officers
  Youth & Moral Education Office

- Sharing on the use social and new media
  Chief New Media Officer
  Mass Communication Office

7 August 2019 (Wednesday), 1500 – 1700hrs – 3 ICAC Ambassadors, 1 attendee from ICAC

- Focus group meeting with ICAC Ambassadors
  Youth & Education Officer and ICAC Ambassadors
  Youth & Moral Education Office

- Visit to CACIT Library
  International Liaison and Training Group

Endnotes

[i] As a point of clarification, the Central Government of the People's Republic of China ratified UNCAC in January 2006. As Hong Kong is organized as a Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China, the Convention was extended to Hong Kong in February 2006 (Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2018).
[ii] The total 2019-2020 expected expenditure, in millions of Hong Kong Dollars, comprises: (1) Corruption Prevention $86.8, (2) Operations $896.0, (3) Preventive Education $91.9, and (4) Enlisting Support $93.0 for a total of $1,167.7m (GovHK, 2019, pp. 620, 622, 623, 625)
[iii] The USD equivalent was derived from the period average of the exchange rate for the trailing six months, where 1 Hong Kong Dollar is equivalent to 0.127595 USD (February 26, 2019 to August 25, 2019) (Oanda , 2019).
[iv] During an interview with the Youth and Moral Education Office (IC2 & IC3, Appendix B), it was noted in 2019 that one new institution received its certification as a tertiary institution. Although this research could not independently confirm a new institution in 2019, the number of total tertiary institutions per the Education Bureau, at the time of research, was confirmed as 22 (Education Bureau, 2019).
[v] An additional reflections-based platform, which relates to Kohlberg's post-conventional level of development, is also the television series, *ICAC Investigators*. While *ICAC Investigators* is not part of the ICAC's education program per se, the self-reflections it instills into the viewer will be discussed further in Chapter 7.1.2.
[vi] The proposed consent form also included permission for an audio recording and subsequent transcript to be created from the recording. However, the request to record and transcribe the interviews was denied, on 1 August 2019, by IC1, Officer in the Community Relations Department. References and quotations contained in the body of the research were based solely on the notes taken by the researcher during the course of the interview itself.
[vii] The local Hong Kong university of each Youth Ambassador is intentionally not specified, as the revelation of the specific university could easily reveal the identity of the individual interviewed. As they were covered under the *blanket consent* provided by the ICAC, their anonymity should also be extended.
[viii] The same.
[ix] The same.

Bibliography

Akers, R., 2009. *Social learning and social structure: A general theory of crime and deviance.* 1 ed. New York: Routledge. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315129587> [Accessed 12 August 2019].

Amir, O. et al., 2005. Psychology, behavioral economics, and public policy. *Marketing Letters,* 16(3-4), pp. 443-454. Available at: <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5bv261k5> [Accessed 21 July 2019].

Anon., 2017. *Public service is a public trust: how will civil servants be accountable for their actions?.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.skylineuniversity.ac.ae/knowledge-update/from-different-corners/public-service-is-a-public-trust-how-will-civil-servants-be-accountable-for-their-actions>
[Accessed 26 August 2019].

Aron, I. E., 1977. Moral philosophy and moral education: a critique of Kohlberg's Theory. *The School Review,* 85(2), pp. 197-217. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1084619> [Accessed 14 August 2019].

Bandura, A., 1971. *Social learning theory.* New York City: General Learning Press. Available at: <http://www.asecib.ase.ro/mps/Bandura_SocialLearningTheory.pdf> [Accessed 20 July 2019].

Bredenoord, B., 2016. *Culture and Queries: Google search data as a reflection of national culture,* Enschede: University of Twente. Available at: <https://essay.utwente.nl/70141/1/Bredenoord_BA_BMS.pdf> [Accessed 6 September 2019].

Buscaglia, E. & van Dijk, J., 2005. Controlling organized crime and corruption in the public sector. *UC Berkeley: Berkeley Program in Law and Economics*, 25 January, pp. 2-32. Available at: <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/08s076vr> [Accessed 25 August 2019].

Cater, J., 1975. *Annual report by the Commissioner of the Independent Commission Against Corruption,* Hong Kong: The Government Printer. Available at: <https://www.icac.org.hk/filemanager/en/Content_27/1975.pdf> [Accessed 13 August 2019].

Census and Statistics Department , 2019. *Population.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.censtatd.gov.hk/hkstat/sub/so20.jsp>
[Accessed 26 August 2019].

Centre for Civil Society and Governance, The University of Hong Kong, 2019. *What is civil society?.* [Online]
Available at: <https://ccsg.hku.hk/ke/civil_society.html>
[Accessed 19 September 2019].

Chan, J. C., 2005. Language, culture, and reform in Hong Kong. In: M. Johnston, ed. *Civil society and corruption: Mobilizing for reform..* Langham, Md; Oxford: University Press of America.

Chan, T., 1999. *Corruption prevention: the Hong Kong experience.* Tokyo, United Nations Asia and Far East Institute for the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders. Available at: <https://www.unafei.or.jp/publications/pdf/RS_No56/No56_30VE_Chan.pdf> [Accessed 7 August 2019].

Cherry, K., 2019. *Kohlberg's Theory of Moral Development.* [Online] Available at: <https://www.verywellmind.com/kohlbergs-theory-of-moral-developmet-2795071> [Accessed 14 August 2019].

Creery, J., 2019a. *Hong Kong stumbles in Reporters Without Borders Press Freedom Index, down 25 places in 10 years.* [Online] Available at: <https://www.hongkongfp.com/2019/04/18/just-hong-kong-stumbles-reporters-without-borders-press-freedom-index-25-places-10-years/> [Accessed 19 September 2019].

Creery, J., 2019b. *Journalism watchdog says past year among the worst for Hong Kong press freedom since 1997, as rally planned for Sunday.* [Online] Available at: <https://www.hongkongfp.com/2019/07/13/journalism-watchdog-says-past-year-among-worst-hong-kong-press-freedom-since-1997-rally-planned-sunday/> [Accessed 19 September 2019].

de Graaf, G., 2007. Causes of corruption: Toward a contextual theory of corruption. *Public Administration Quarterly,* 31(1/2, Spring 2007-Summer 2007), pp. 39-86. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41288282> [Accessed 21 July 2019].

de Speville, B., 2016. The struggle against corruption: Progress at a snail's pace. Why?. *Asia-Pacific Review,* 23(1), pp. 115-124. Available at: <http://content.ebscohost.com/ContentServer.asp?T=P&P=AN&K=116620677&S=R&D=poh&EbscoContent=dGJyMNHX8kSeprY40dvuOLCmr1Cep65Sr6y4SbeWxWXS&ContentCustomer=dGJyMOzpsEuvrq5JuePfgeyx44Dt6fIA> [Accessed 8 September 2019].

Donald, D. C., 2013. Countering corrupting conflicts of interest: the example of Hong Kong. In: J. Horder & P. Alldridge, eds. *Modern bribery law - comparative perspectives.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 66-94.

Education Bureau, 2019. *Education - Tertiary Education.* [Online] Available at: <https://www.youth.gov.hk/en/info-centre/education/tertiary-students.htm> [Accessed 16 August 2019].

Education Bureau, 2019. *Secondary Education.* [Online] Available at: <https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/about-edb/publications-

stat/figures/sec.html>
[Accessed 13 August 2019].

Faber, M. A., 2009. *Understanding personality through preferences in popular mass media: an archetypal approach,* Durham: University of New Haven. Available at: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/aee8/fe2e218ec779c7a994df95432edd22e76487.pdf?_ga=2.7702578.1248742164.1566269588-1881058075.1566269588>
[Accessed 20 August 2019].

Goldchain, M., 2019. *Expo highlights the rise of VR, AR in educational game design, but will educators want it?.* [Online]
Available at: <https://marketbrief.edweek.org/marketplace-k-12/vr-ar-ed-games-expo-2019/>
[Accessed 13 August 2019].

GovHK, 2017. *Head 72 - Independent Commission Against Corruption,* Hong Kong: GovHK. Available at: <https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr16-17/english/counmtg/papers/cm20170222-sp069_070/pdf/head072.pdf> [Accessed 19 August 2019].

GovHK, 2018. *Head 72 - Independent Commission Against Corruption,* Hong Kong: GovHK. Available at: <https://www.budget.gov.hk/2018/eng/pdf/head072.pdf>
[Accessed 13 August 2019].

GovHK, 2019. *Head 72 - Independent Commission Against Corruption,* Hong Kong: GovHK. Available at: <https://www.budget.gov.hk/2019/eng/pdf/head072.pdf>
[Accessed 13 August 2019].

GovHK, 2019. *The 2019-20 Budget.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.budget.gov.hk/2019/eng/index.html>
[Accessed 13 August 2019].

govHK, n.d. *Hong Kong: the Facts - ICAC,* Hong Kong: govHK. Available at: <https://www.gov.hk/en/about/abouthk/factsheets/docs/icac.pdf> [Accessed 10 August 2019].

Hofstede Insights, n.d. *Hong Kong.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.hofstede-insights.com/country/hong-kong/>
[Accessed 17 August 2019].

Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2016. *Statutory Duty.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.icac.org.hk/en/crd/duty/index.html>
[Accessed 17 July 2019].

Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2016. *Strategy.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.icac.org.hk/en/crd/strategy/index.html>
[Accessed 16 July 2019].

Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2018. *United Nations Convention Against Corruption.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.icac.org.hk/en/intl-persp/engage/united-nations-convention-against-corruption-/index.html>
[Accessed 24 July 2019].

Hong Kong Journalists Association, 2019. *2019 Annual Report,* Hong Kong: Hong Kong Journalists Association. Available at: <https://www.hkja.org.hk/PDF/HKJA_Annual_Report_2019_eng_s.pdf> [Accessed 19 September 2019].

ICACChannel, 2014. *"Gee Dor Dor's Space Adventure" Cartoon Movie* [video online]
Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wbo8h1xri38&list=PLDD0BE5ECDF2562C6&index=32&t=0s> Accessed 6 August 2019.

ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office, 2019. *Strategy for youth and moral education work,* Hong Kong: ICAC.

Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2017. *Anti-corruption laws.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.icac.org.hk/en/law/law/index.html>
[Accessed 14 August 2019].

Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019a. *greedy_kin Instagram.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.instagram.com/greedy_kin/>
[Accessed 10 August 2019].

Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019b. *ICACChannel Youtube.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/user/ICACChannel>
[Accessed 5 October 2019].

Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019c. *iTeen.* [Online]
Available at: <https://iteencamp.icac.hk/EngIntro/Shows>
[Accessed 10 August 2019].

Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2019d. *Major findings 2018 ICAC Annual Survey,* Hong Kong: Independent Commission Against Corruption. Available at: <https://www.icac.org.hk/filemanager/PressRelease/en/upload/686/1_Major%20findings-2018%20%20ICAC%20Annual%20Survey.pdf> [Accessed 16 August 2019].

Independent Commission Against Corruption, n.d. *Activities manuals for teachers.* [Online]
Available at: <https://me.icac.hk/new/5538/#/en/ActivitiesManual/SuggestedActivities>
[Accessed 14 August 2019].

Independent Commission Against Corruption, n.d. *Introduction.* [Online]
Available at: <https://me.icac.hk/new/5538/#/en/Introduction/iTeenLeaders>
[Accessed 14 August 2019].

Johnston, M., 2005. *Syndromes of corruption: wealth, power, and democracy.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Johnston, M., 2018. Reforming reform: revising the anticorruption playbook. *Daedalus,* 147(3), pp. 50-62.

Koehler, M., 2012. The story of the Foreign Corrupt Practices Act. *Ohio State Law Journal,* 73(5), pp. 930 - 1013. Available at:
<http://moritzlaw.osu.edu/students/groups/oslj/files/2013/02/73.5.Koehler.pdf>
[Accessed 11 August 2019].

Kwok, T. M.-w., 2006. *Formulating an effective anti-corruption strategy - the experience of Hong Kong ICAC.* Tokyo, United Nations Asia and Far East Institute for the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders (UNAFEI). Available at:
<https://www.unafei.or.jp/publications/pdf/RS_No69/No69_23VE_Man-wai2.pdf>
[Accessed 25 August 2019].

Kwok, T. M.-W., n.d. *Comprehensive & effective approach to anti-corruption. The Hong Kong ICAC experience, with a view on new approaches in the fight against corruption.* [Online]
Available at: <http://www.kwok-manwai.com/articles/Comprehensive_Effective.html>
[Accessed 17 September 2019].

Lam, A. & Koo, T., 2019. *Letters.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.scmp.com/comment/letters/article/3014186/whats-behind-hong-kong-street-protests-natural-faith-freedom-and>
[Accessed 19 September 2019].

Lambsdorff, J. G., 2007. *The institutional economics of corruption and reform: theory, evidence, and policy.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Legislative Council of Hong Kong, 1974. *Cap. 204 Independent Commission Against Corruption Ordinance.* Hong Kong: s.n. Available at:
<https://www.elegislation.gov.hk/hk/cap204!en?xpid=ID_1438402828620_003>
[Accessed 21 July 2019].

Leung, E., 2017. *Success factors for smashing corruption and new approaches to sustain probity culture in Hong Kong.* Tokyo, United Nations Asia and Far East Institute for the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders (UNAFEI). Available at:
<https://www.unafei.or.jp/publications/pdf/RS_No105/No105_16_IP_HongKong.pdf> [Accessed 10 August 2019].

Lewis, S. A., 2011. Reclaiming our sense of self in a globalized world. *HuffPost,* [online] 12 June.

Available at: <https://www.huffpost.com/entry/globalization-sense-of-self_b_874873>
[Accessed 18 August 2019].

Manion, M., 2004. Lessons for Mainland China from anti-corruption reform in Hong Kong. *China Review,* 4(2), pp. 81-97. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23461885> [Accessed 12 August 2019].

Mbaku, J. M., 2008. Corruption cleanups in Africa: lessons from public choice theory. *Journal of Asian and African Studies,* 43(4), pp. 427-456. Available at: <10.1177/0021909608091975> [Accessed 8 September 2019].

McLeod, S., 2013. *Kohlberg's stages of moral development.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.simplypsychology.org/kohlberg.html>
[Accessed 19 August 2019].

Morris, S. D. & Klesner, J. L., 2010. Corruption and trust: theoretical considerations and evidence from Mexico. *Comparative Political Studies,* 43(10), pp. 1258-1285. Available at: <https://www.vanderbilt.edu/lapop/news/092410a.pdf> [Accessed 8 September 2019].

news.gov.hk, 2004. *Flying bunny to promote graft-free virtues.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.news.gov.hk/isd/ebulletin/en/category/lawandorder/040408/features/html/040408en08005.htm>
[Accessed 22 August 2019].

Ngok, M., 2008. Civil society and democratization in Hong Kong - paradox and duality. *Taiwan Journal of Democracy,* 4(2), pp. 155-175. Available at: <http://www.tfd.org.tw/export/sites/tfd/files/publication/journal/dj0402/155-176.pdf> [Accessed 19 September 2019].

Ngu, J., Fung, M. & Yan, T., 2019. *ICAC Ambassador Program 2018/19,* Hong Kong: ICAC Youth and Moral Education Office.

Oanda , 2019. *Historical Exchange Rates.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www1.oanda.com/fx-for-business/historical-rates>
[Accessed 25 August 2019].

Ochulor, C. L. & Bassey, E. P., 2010. Analysis of corruption from the ethical and moral perspectives. *European Journal of Scientific Research,* 44(3), pp. 466-476. Available at: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/fcb9/b401934f8d26cae3f2b39d543a42f733f9f9.pdf> [Accessed 19 September 2019].

Pertiwi, K., 2018. Contextualizing corruption: a cross-disciplinary approach to studying corruption in organizations. *Administrative Sciences,* 8(12), pp. 1-19. Available at: <https://res.mdpi.com/admsci/admsci-08-00012/article_deploy/admsci-08-00012.pdf?filename=&attachment=1> [Accessed 11 September 2019].

Psychology Today, n.d. *Social learning theory.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/basics/social-learning-theory>
[Accessed 8 September 2019].

Punch, M., 2008. The organization did it: individuals, corporations and crime. In: J. Minkes & L. Minkes, eds. *Corporate and White-collar Crime.* London: Sage Publications Ltd, pp. 111-115.

Punch, M., 2009. *Police corruption. Deviance, accountability and reform in policing.* London: Routledge.

Quah, J. S. T., 2011. Hong Kong. In: *Curbing corruption in Asian countries: an impossible dream?.* Bingley: Emerald Group Publishing Limited, pp. 237-268.

Reporters Without Borders, 2019. *2019 World Press Freedom Index.* [Online]
Available at: <https://rsf.org/en/ranking/2019>
[Accessed 19 September 2019].

Scott, I. & Gong, T., 2019. *Corruption prevention and governance in Hong Kong.* Abingdon: Routledge.

Skidmore, M. J., 1996. Promise and peril in combating corruption: Hong Kong's ICAC. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science,* 437(September), pp. 118-130. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1048368> [Accessed 10 August 2019].

Sohmen, H., 1999. Critical importance of controlling corruption. *The International Lawyer,* 33(4), pp. 863-873. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40707492> [Accessed 8 August 2019].

Tavits, M., 2010. Why do people engage in corruption? The case of Estonia. *Social Forces,* 88(3), pp. 1257-1279. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40645890> [Accessed 22 July 2019].

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004. *United Nations Convention Against Corruption,* New York: United Nations. Available at: <https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/Publications/Convention/08-50026_E.pdf> [Accessed 26 July 2019].

United Nations, 1948. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/>
[Accessed 19 September 2019].

Vinney, C., 2019. *Kohlberg's Stages of Moral Development.* [Online]
Available at: <https://www.thoughtco.com/kohlbergs-stages-of-moral-development-4689125>
[Accessed 14 August 2019].

Wong, C., 2019. *Anti-corruption measures of the Independent Commission Against Corruption, Hong Kong Special Administration Region, China and strategies and experience of its Community Relations Department.* Tokyo, United Nations Asia and

Far East Institute for the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders. Available at: <https://www.unafei.or.jp/publications/pdf/RS_No107/No107_22_VE_Wong_1.pdf> [Accessed 10 September 2019].

World Population Review, 2019. *Hong Kong Population.* [Online] Available at: <http://worldpopulationreview.com/countries/hong-kong-population/> [Accessed 23 August 2019].

Wu, A., 2006. Hong Kong's fight against corruption has lessons for others. *Hong Kong Journal,* April, Issue 2, pp. 1-6. Available at: <https://carnegieendowment.org/hkjournal/archive/2006_spring/wu.html> [Accessed 31 July 2019].

Yau, C., 2019. Financial Secretary Paul Chan warns that anti-government protests – paired with US-China trade war – could plunge Hong Kong's economy into recession. *South China Morning Post,* [online] 5 August. Available at: <https://www.scmp.com/news/hong-kong/politics/article/3021526/financial-secretary-paul-chan-warns-anti-government> [Accessed 26 August 2019].

IACA
INTERNATIONAL
ANTI-CORRUPTION
ACADEMY

Publisher & Layout:
International Anti-Corruption Academy

Muenchendorfer Strasse 2
2361 Laxenburg, Austria

+43 2236 710 718 100

mail@iaca.int

www.iaca.int